IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF GEORGIA BRUNSWICK DIVISION

EMMA JANE PROSPERO,

Plaintiff,

vs.

DEPUTY RYAN SULLIVAN and
LT. RUSSELL PRESCOTT,

Defendants.

Plaintiff,

CIVIL ACTION FILE

NO.: 2:20-cv-110

VIDEOCONFERENCE DEPOSITION OF SHERIFF JIM PROCTOR

10:01 a.m.

March 10, 2021

Brown Readdick Bumgartner Carter Strickland & Watkins
5 Glynn Avenue
Brunswick, Georgia

Annette Pacheco, RPR, RMR, CCR-B-2153

P. O. Box 1894 (31521)
1607 Norwich Street

Cilbert & Jones
Certified Court Reporters

gilbertandjones l@gmail.com 912.264.1670 P. O. Box 14515 (31416) 7505 Waters Avenue, F3 Savannah, GA 31406

1 of 37 sheets Page 1 to 1 of 141

Brunswick, GA 31520

1	APPEARANCES OF COUNSEL					
2	On behalf of the Plaintiff:					
3	CLARE NORINS, Esq. (By videoconference) UNIVERSITY OF GEORGIA SCHOOL OF LAW					
4	FIRST AMENDMENT CLINIC P.O. Box 388					
5	Athens, Georgia 30603 706-542-1419					
6	cnorins@uga.edu					
7	On behalf of the Defendants:					
8	BRADLEY J. WATKINS, Esq. (By videoconference)					
9	BROWN READDICK BUMGARTNER CARTER STRICKLAND & WATKINS					
10	Five Glynn Avenue Brunswick, Georgia 31521					
11	912-264-8544 bwatkins@brbcsw.com					
12						
13	Also Present: Kirstiana Perryman					
14	Sam Hamilton					
15						
16						
17						
18						
19						
20						
21						
22						
23						
24						
25						

			3		5	
1 2	INDEX TO EXAMINATIONS			1	BY MS. NORINS:	
3	<u>Page</u>		2	Q. Okay. So Sheriff Proctor, have you e	ver	
4 5	Examination by Ms. Norins 5		3	been deposed before?		
6		n by Mr. Watkins	136	4	A. Yes, ma'am.	
7 8				5	Q. How many times?	
9		TNDEY TO EVUIDIT	T.C.	6	A. Once.	
10 11	Plaintiff's	INDEX TO EXHIBIT	<u>15</u>	7	Q. And when was that?	
12	_Exhibit_	<u>Description</u>	<u>Page</u>	8	A. It would have been 25 to 30 years ag	jo.
12	Exhibit 35	Letter dated May 10,	2017, to	9	Q. Okay. I'm going to ask you to speak	up
13		r. and Mrs. Joseph Pros om James K. Proctor		10	because you're very soft.	
14	IFC	om James K. Proctor	24	11	A. Sorry.	
1.5	Exhibit 36	Section 16-11-39.2 U		12	MR. WATKINS: Scoot up if you need	to and
15	CO	nduct during a 9-1-1- c	an 74	13	adjust any of that.	
16	Exhibit 37	Мар	117	14	A. It would have been about 25 to 30 years	ears
17	Exhibit 38	Call Log Report	130	15	ago.	
10				16	Q. (By Ms. Norins) And was that deposit	tion
18				17	taken in your capacity as a law enforcement of	fficial
19				18	or in your personal capacity?	
20				19	A. Law enforcement.	
				20	Q. And were you a party in that lawsuit,	а
21				21	plaintiff or defendant?	
22				22	A. No, ma'am.	
23		l Exhibits 35 through 38 the original transcript.		23	Q. You were just a	
		от дина и апостъри	,	24	A. Yes, ma'am.	
24 25				25	THE COURT REPORTER: I'm sorry. Y	ou were?
		GILBERT & JONES			GILBERT & JONES	
			4		6	
1						
	•	Reporter disclosure mad	•	1	MS. NORINS: Just a witness.	
2	Article	10.B of the Rules and R	Regulations of the	2	THE WITNESS: A witness.	
2	Article Board o	10.B of the Rules and R of Court Reporting of th	Regulations of the	2	THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORTER: Say that aga	in. I'm
2 3 4	Article Board o of Geor	10.B of the Rules and R of Court Reporting of th gia.)	Regulations of the ne Judicial Council	2 3 4	THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORTER: Say that aga sorry, Ms. Norins.	in. I'm
2 3 4 5	Article Board o of Geor Ms	10.B of the Rules and R of Court Reporting of th gia.) S. NORINS: Good morn	Regulations of the need of the	2 3 4 5	THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORTER: Say that aga sorry, Ms. Norins. THE WITNESS: A witness.	
2 3 4 5 6	Article Board of Geor MS	10.B of the Rules and R of Court Reporting of th gia.) S. NORINS: Good morn Proctor. Thank you for	Regulations of the ne Judicial Council ning, r spending some	2 3 4 5 6	THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORTER: Say that aga sorry, Ms. Norins. THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORT: Okay. I need the second seco	
2 3 4 5 6 7	Article Board of Geor MS Sheriff time wi	10.B of the Rules and R of Court Reporting of th gia.) S. NORINS: Good morn Proctor. Thank you for ith us this morning. My	Regulations of the needed Judicial Council ning, repending some name is	2 3 4 5 6 7	THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORTER: Say that aga sorry, Ms. Norins. THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORT: Okay. I need to question. I'm sorry.	
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Article Board of Geor MS Sheriff time wi	of the Rules and Row to the Rules and Row to the Reporting of the gia.) S. NORINS: Good morn Proctor. Thank you for the us this morning. My orins. I direct the First	Regulations of the need Judicial Council ning, repending some name is the Amendment	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORTER: Say that aga sorry, Ms. Norins. THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORT: Okay. I need to question. I'm sorry. THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry.	he
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Article Board of Of Geor MS Sheriff time wi Clare N Legal C	10.B of the Rules and Rof Court Reporting of the gia.) S. NORINS: Good morn Proctor. Thank you for ith us this morning. My orins. I direct the First linic at the University of	Regulations of the ne Judicial Council ning, r spending some r, name is t Amendment of Georgia School	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORTER: Say that aga sorry, Ms. Norins. THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORT: Okay. I need to question. I'm sorry. THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry. Q. (By Ms. Norins) You were a witness in	he
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Article Board of Geor MS Sheriff time wi Clare N Legal C	10.B of the Rules and Rof Court Reporting of the gia.) S. NORINS: Good morn Proctor. Thank you for ith us this morning. My orins. I direct the First linic at the University of in Athens. And the Clir	Regulations of the see Judicial Council ning, r spending some r name is t Amendment of Georgia School nic, along with	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORTER: Say that aga sorry, Ms. Norins. THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORT: Okay. I need the question. I'm sorry. THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry. Q. (By Ms. Norins) You were a witness in case you were deposed in 25 or 30 years ago?	he
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Article Board of Of Geor MS Sheriff time wi Clare N Legal C Of Law Kim Bu	10.B of the Rules and Rof Court Reporting of the gia.) S. NORINS: Good morn Proctor. Thank you for ith us this morning. My orins. I direct the First linic at the University of in Athens. And the Clirtler, who's not here too	Regulations of the see Judicial Council ning, r spending some r name is t Amendment of Georgia School nic, along with	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORTER: Say that aga sorry, Ms. Norins. THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORT: Okay. I need the question. I'm sorry. THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry. Q. (By Ms. Norins) You were a witness in case you were deposed in 25 or 30 years ago? A. Yes, ma'am.	he n the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Article Board of Of Geor MS Sheriff time wi Clare N Legal C Of Law Kim Bu	10.B of the Rules and Rof Court Reporting of the gia.) S. NORINS: Good morn Proctor. Thank you for ith us this morning. My orins. I direct the First linic at the University of in Athens. And the Clirtler, who's not here too intiff in this matter,	Regulations of the see Judicial Council ning, r spending some r name is t Amendment of Georgia School nic, along with	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORTER: Say that aga sorry, Ms. Norins. THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORT: Okay. I need the question. I'm sorry. THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry. Q. (By Ms. Norins) You were a witness in case you were deposed in 25 or 30 years ago? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Have you ever testified under oath in	he n the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Article Board of Geor MS Sheriff time wi Clare N Legal C of Law Kim But the plai	10.B of the Rules and Rof Court Reporting of the gia.) S. NORINS: Good morn Proctor. Thank you for ith us this morning. My orins. I direct the First linic at the University of in Athens. And the Clirater, who's not here too intiff in this matter, and Jane Prospero.	Regulations of the see Judicial Council ning, respending some represent along with day, we represent	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORTER: Say that aga sorry, Ms. Norins. THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORT: Okay. I need the question. I'm sorry. THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry. Q. (By Ms. Norins) You were a witness in case you were deposed in 25 or 30 years ago? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Have you ever testified under oath in other context other than the deposition?	he n the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Article Board of Of Geor MS Sheriff time wi Clare N Legal C Of Law Kim But the plai Mrs. En	10.B of the Rules and Rof Court Reporting of the gia.) S. NORINS: Good morn Proctor. Thank you for ith us this morning. My orins. I direct the First linic at the University of in Athens. And the Clirater, who's not here too intiff in this matter, man Jane Prospero.	Regulations of the see Judicial Council ning, respending some represent Amendment of Georgia School nic, along with day, we represent uce the other	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORTER: Say that aga sorry, Ms. Norins. THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORT: Okay. I need the question. I'm sorry. THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry. Q. (By Ms. Norins) You were a witness in case you were deposed in 25 or 30 years ago? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Have you ever testified under oath in other context other than the deposition? A. Yes, ma'am.	n the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Article Board of Of Geor MS Sheriff time wi Clare N Legal C Of Law Kim But the plai Mrs. En Ar	10.B of the Rules and Rof Court Reporting of the gia.) S. NORINS: Good morn Proctor. Thank you for ith us this morning. My orins. I direct the First linic at the University of in Athens. And the Clirtler, who's not here too intiff in this matter, man Jane Prospero. Ind I just want to introd the you may see on you	Regulations of the de Judicial Council hing, respending some represent hick along with day, we represent duce the other ar screen.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORTER: Say that aga sorry, Ms. Norins. THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORT: Okay. I need the question. I'm sorry. THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry. Q. (By Ms. Norins) You were a witness in case you were deposed in 25 or 30 years ago? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Have you ever testified under oath in other context other than the deposition? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. What context have you testified under	n the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Article Board of Geor MS Sheriff time wi Clare N Legal C of Law Kim But the plai Mrs. En folks w Sam Ha	10.B of the Rules and Rof Court Reporting of the gia.) S. NORINS: Good morn Proctor. Thank you for ith us this morning. My orins. I direct the First linic at the University of in Athens. And the Clirater, who's not here too intiff in this matter, and Jane Prospero. Ind I just want to introd the you may see on you mailton is the legal fellon.	Regulations of the me Judicial Council ming, repending some me makes to a mendment of Georgia School mic, along with day, we represent muce the other mescreen.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORTER: Say that aga sorry, Ms. Norins. THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORT: Okay. I need the question. I'm sorry. THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry. Q. (By Ms. Norins) You were a witness in case you were deposed in 25 or 30 years ago? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Have you ever testified under oath in other context other than the deposition? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. What context have you testified under oath?	n the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Article Board of of Geor MS Sheriff time wi Clare N Legal C of Law Kim But the plai Mrs. En Ar folks w Sam Ha clinic.	10.B of the Rules and Rof Court Reporting of the gia.) S. NORINS: Good morn Proctor. Thank you for ith us this morning. My orins. I direct the First linic at the University of in Athens. And the Clirater, who's not here too intiff in this matter, man Jane Prospero. Ind I just want to introd ho you may see on you milton is the legal fellockirstiana Perryman and	Regulations of the see Judicial Council ning, respending some represent nic, along with day, we represent uce the other ar screen.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORTER: Say that aga sorry, Ms. Norins. THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORT: Okay. I need the question. I'm sorry. THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry. Q. (By Ms. Norins) You were a witness in case you were deposed in 25 or 30 years ago? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Have you ever testified under oath in other context other than the deposition? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. What context have you testified under oath? A. As a law enforcement officer, as the	n the any
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Article Board of of Geor MS Sheriff time wi Clare N Legal C of Law Kim But the plai Mrs. En Ar folks w Sam Ha clinic.	10.B of the Rules and Rof Court Reporting of the gia.) S. NORINS: Good morn Proctor. Thank you for ith us this morning. My orins. I direct the First linic at the University of in Athens. And the Clirtler, who's not here too intiff in this matter, ama Jane Prospero. Ind I just want to introd ho you may see on you milton is the legal fellowing the result of the legal fellowing the result of the legal fellowing the legal fell	Regulations of the see Judicial Council ning, respending some represent nic, along with day, we represent uce the other ar screen.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORTER: Say that aga sorry, Ms. Norins. THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORT: Okay. I need the question. I'm sorry. THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry. Q. (By Ms. Norins) You were a witness in case you were deposed in 25 or 30 years ago? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Have you ever testified under oath in other context other than the deposition? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. What context have you testified under oath? A. As a law enforcement officer, as the affiant in warrants and a couple of civil lawsuit	n the any
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Article Board of Of Geor MS Sheriff time wi Clare N Legal C Of Law Kim But the plai Mrs. En Ar folks w Sam Ha clinic. Janay A	10.B of the Rules and Rof Court Reporting of the gia.) S. NORINS: Good morn Proctor. Thank you for ith us this morning. My orins. I direct the First linic at the University of in Athens. And the Clirater, who's not here too intiff in this matter, and Jane Prospero. In a Just want to introd ho you may see on you milton is the legal fello Kirstiana Perryman and Alexander are both study on this case.	Regulations of the see Judicial Council ning, respending some represent see a	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORTER: Say that aga sorry, Ms. Norins. THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORT: Okay. I need the question. I'm sorry. THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry. Q. (By Ms. Norins) You were a witness in case you were deposed in 25 or 30 years ago? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Have you ever testified under oath in other context other than the deposition? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. What context have you testified under oath? A. As a law enforcement officer, as the affiant in warrants and a couple of civil lawsuit a witness.	n the any er
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Article Board of of Geor MS Sheriff time wi Clare N Legal C of Law Kim But the plai Mrs. Em Ar folks w Sam Ha clinic. Janay A working	10.B of the Rules and Rof Court Reporting of the gia.) S. NORINS: Good morn Proctor. Thank you for ith us this morning. My orins. I direct the First linic at the University of in Athens. And the Clirater, who's not here too intiff in this matter, and I just want to introd ho you may see on you milton is the legal fellow Kirstiana Perryman and Alexander are both study on this case.	Regulations of the see Judicial Council ning, respending some represent see a	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORTER: Say that aga sorry, Ms. Norins. THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORT: Okay. I need the question. I'm sorry. THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry. Q. (By Ms. Norins) You were a witness in case you were deposed in 25 or 30 years ago? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Have you ever testified under oath in other context other than the deposition? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. What context have you testified under oath? A. As a law enforcement officer, as the affiant in warrants and a couple of civil lawsuit a witness. Q. Okay. Were you a party in any of tho	n the any er
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Article Board of of Geor MS Sheriff time wi Clare N Legal C of Law Kim But the plai Mrs. Em Ar folks w Sam Ha clinic. Janay A working	10.B of the Rules and Rof Court Reporting of the gia.) S. NORINS: Good morn Proctor. Thank you for ith us this morning. My orins. I direct the First linic at the University of in Athens. And the Clirater, who's not here too intiff in this matter, and I just want to introd ho you may see on you milton is the legal fellowing the result of the standard are both study on this case. Kay. Well, let me let An ear you.	Regulations of the de Judicial Council hing, respending some represent of Georgia School hic, along with day, we represent uce the other rescreen. The with the defents in the clinic hinette go ahead	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORTER: Say that aga sorry, Ms. Norins. THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORT: Okay. I need the question. I'm sorry. THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry. Q. (By Ms. Norins) You were a witness in case you were deposed in 25 or 30 years ago? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Have you ever testified under oath in other context other than the deposition? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. What context have you testified under oath? A. As a law enforcement officer, as the affiant in warrants and a couple of civil lawsuit a witness. Q. Okay. Were you a party in any of the other civil lawsuits?	n the any er
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Article Board of of Geor MS Sheriff time wi Clare N Legal C of Law Kim But the plai Mrs. En Ar folks w Sam Ha clinic. Janay A working	10.B of the Rules and Rof Court Reporting of the gia.) S. NORINS: Good morn Proctor. Thank you for ith us this morning. My orins. I direct the First linic at the University of in Athens. And the Clirater, who's not here too intiff in this matter, man Jane Prospero. In a Just want to introd ho you may see on you milton is the legal fellow Kirstiana Perryman and Riexander are both study on this case. Kay. Well, let me let An ear you. SHERIFF JAMES PRO	Regulations of the me Judicial Council ming, respending some mane is the Amendment of Georgia School mic, along with day, we represent the uce the other maners of the council michael	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORTER: Say that aga sorry, Ms. Norins. THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORT: Okay. I need the question. I'm sorry. THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry. Q. (By Ms. Norins) You were a witness in case you were deposed in 25 or 30 years ago? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Have you ever testified under oath in other context other than the deposition? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. What context have you testified under oath? A. As a law enforcement officer, as the affiant in warrants and a couple of civil lawsuit a witness. Q. Okay. Were you a party in any of the other civil lawsuits? A. No, ma'am.	n the any er ts as
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Article Board of of Geor MS Sheriff time wi Clare N Legal C of Law Kim But the plai Mrs. Em Ar folks w Sam Ha clinic. Janay A working Ok and swe	10.B of the Rules and Rof Court Reporting of the gia.) S. NORINS: Good morn Proctor. Thank you for ith us this morning. My orins. I direct the First linic at the University of in Athens. And the Clirater, who's not here too intiff in this matter, and Jane Prospero. Ind I just want to introd ho you may see on you milton is the legal fellow Kirstiana Perryman and Kirstiana Perryman and Jexander are both study on this case. Kay. Well, let me let Andear you. SHERIFF JAMES PRO In first duly sworn, was	Regulations of the me Judicial Council ming, respending some mane is the Amendment of Georgia School mic, along with day, we represent the uce the other maners of the council michael	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORTER: Say that aga sorry, Ms. Norins. THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORT: Okay. I need the question. I'm sorry. THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry. Q. (By Ms. Norins) You were a witness in case you were deposed in 25 or 30 years ago? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Have you ever testified under oath in other context other than the deposition? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. What context have you testified under oath? A. As a law enforcement officer, as the affiant in warrants and a couple of civil lawsuit a witness. Q. Okay. Were you a party in any of the other civil lawsuits? A. No, ma'am. Q. About how many times in your lifetimes.	n the any er ts as
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Article Board of of Geor MS Sheriff time wi Clare N Legal C of Law Kim But the plai Mrs. En Ar folks w Sam Ha clinic. Janay A working	10.B of the Rules and Rof Court Reporting of the gia.) S. NORINS: Good morn Proctor. Thank you for ith us this morning. My orins. I direct the First linic at the University of in Athens. And the Clirater, who's not here too intiff in this matter, ama Jane Prospero. Ind I just want to introd ho you may see on you milton is the legal fellowing on this case. Kay. Well, let me let An ear you. SHERIFF JAMES PRO In first duly sworn, was follows:	Regulations of the me Judicial Council ming, respending some mane is the Amendment of Georgia School mic, along with day, we represent the uce the other maners of the council michael	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORTER: Say that aga sorry, Ms. Norins. THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORT: Okay. I need the question. I'm sorry. THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry. Q. (By Ms. Norins) You were a witness in case you were deposed in 25 or 30 years ago? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Have you ever testified under oath in other context other than the deposition? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. What context have you testified under oath? A. As a law enforcement officer, as the affiant in warrants and a couple of civil lawsuit a witness. Q. Okay. Were you a party in any of the other civil lawsuits? A. No, ma'am. Q. About how many times in your lifetim you testified under oath approximately?	n the any er ts as
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Article Board of of Geor MS Sheriff time wi Clare N Legal C of Law Kim But the plai Mrs. Em Ar folks w Sam Ha clinic. Janay A working Ok and swe	10.B of the Rules and Rof Court Reporting of the gia.) S. NORINS: Good morn Proctor. Thank you for ith us this morning. My orins. I direct the First linic at the University of in Athens. And the Clirater, who's not here too intiff in this matter, and Jane Prospero. Ind I just want to introd ho you may see on you milton is the legal fellow Kirstiana Perryman and Kirstiana Perryman and Jexander are both study on this case. Kay. Well, let me let Andear you. SHERIFF JAMES PRO In first duly sworn, was	Regulations of the de Judicial Council ning, respending some represent of Georgia School nic, along with day, we represent uce the other rescreen. The with the defents in the clinic nnette go ahead octor, examined and	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORTER: Say that aga sorry, Ms. Norins. THE WITNESS: A witness. THE COURT REPORT: Okay. I need the question. I'm sorry. THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry. Q. (By Ms. Norins) You were a witness in case you were deposed in 25 or 30 years ago? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. Have you ever testified under oath in other context other than the deposition? A. Yes, ma'am. Q. What context have you testified under oath? A. As a law enforcement officer, as the affiant in warrants and a couple of civil lawsuit a witness. Q. Okay. Were you a party in any of the other civil lawsuits? A. No, ma'am. Q. About how many times in your lifetimes.	he n the any er ts as

7

8

13

14

15

25

5

- 1 Q. Many times; is that fair to say?
- Yes, ma'am. 2 Α.
- 3 Q. So I know you're experienced with it, but
- 4 just to lay some ground rules so that we all are on
- 5 the same page. You are here as a witness in this
- 6 case. There's no claim against you individually.
- 7 We're just trying to understand, you know, a little
- 8 bit better what happened with Mrs. Prospero and her
- 9 arrest.

10

11

12

13

14

16

23

1

2

3

4

5

7

- It is important that you answer the questions verbally so that the court reporter can take down your answers and that, you know, speak loudly enough so that she can hear you. I know it's not ideal being on Zoom, but we're doing our best
- 15 here.
- If you don't understand one of my 17 questions, please let me know and I'm happy to 18 rephrase. It is important that you let me finish the 19 question even if you know what the question is going 20 to be because, for the record, we need the complete
- 21 question and the complete answer on the transcript.
- 22 And it's hard if we talk over each other.
 - If you need a break at any time, please
- 24 let me know, and that's fine. I'll just ask that you 25
 - answer any pending question before we take the break. **GILBERT & JONES**
 - And Mr. Watkins may object to some of my questions for the record, but you would still answer them unless he directs you not to answer.
 - Do you have any questions about those parameters?
- 6 Α. No, ma'am.
 - Q. Okay. How are you feeling today?
- 8 Α. I'm feeling okay.
- 9 Q. Okay. Are you sick in any way?
- 10 Α. No, ma'am.
- 11 Q. All right. Have you consumed any drugs or
- alcohol within the last eight hours that would affect 12
- 13 your ability to testify today?
- 14 Α. No, ma'am.
- Q. 15 Is there anything affecting your memory 16 today?
- 17 Α. My wife would say so, but no, ma'am.
- Okay. Is there anything going on with you 18
- 19 today that would inhibit or impair your ability to
- 20 give truthful and accurate testimony?
- 21 Α. No, ma'am.
- 22 Q. Do you have a general understanding of
- 23 what this case is about?
- I believe so, yes, ma'am. 24 Α
- 25 Q. What is your understanding?
 - **GILBERT & JONES**

- Is that Ms. Prospero is alleging that she 2 was wrongfully arrested for an offense that she 3 committed.
- 4 Okay. And do you understand who the Q. 5 parties in this case are, the plaintiff and the 6 defendant?
 - Α. Two of my deputies and Mr. and Mrs. Prospero.
- 9 Okay. And other than the claim that she 10 was wrongfully arrested, are you aware of any other claims that Mrs. Prospero is alleging in this 11 12 lawsuit?
 - Α. I'm sorry. No, ma'am.
 - Okay. What did you do to prepare for today's deposition?
- 16 I spoke with my attorney and we went over 17 a letter that I had written that I'm glad he reminded 18 me of because I honestly don't remember having 19 written it, and the code section dealing with the 20 offense.
- 21 Q. And when you say your attorney, who are 22 you referring to?
- 23 Α. Mr. Watkins.
- 24 Q. Do you have a retainer agreement with him?
 - Α. No, ma'am. He's retained by the insurance

GILBERT & JONES

10

- company that represents us. 1
- 2 Okay. Do you have an oral agreement with Mr. Watkins that he'll represent you today at this 3
- 4 deposition?
 - Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 6 And how long did you meet with Mr. Watkins Q.
- 7 for?
- 8 We've been sitting and visiting. So the 9 actual meeting portion, a few minutes.
- 10 And that was this morning before we got Q. started? 11
- Α. 12 Yes, ma'am.
- 13 Did you speak with anyone else besides
- 14 Mr. Watkins to prepare for today's deposition?
- 15 No, ma'am. Α.
- Are you aware that other members of the 16 Q.
- 17 sheriff's office have been deposed in this case?
- 18 Yes, ma'am. Α
 - Q. Who are you aware have already been
- 20 deposed?

19

- 21 One of my 911 operators as well as my Α. 22 chief deputy and my jail administrator.
- 23 Have you spoken with any of the folks 24 already deposed about what happened in their 25 depositions?

Α. Yes, ma'am.

1

4

5

7

14

15

1

7

- 2 Q. And who have you spoken with about their 3 depositions?
 - Α. Major Mastroianni and Colonel Byerly.
- When did you speak with Major Mastroianni 6 about his deposition?
 - Yesterday and the day before.
- 8 Okay. So the day before would have been the first conversation with Mastroianni about his 9 deposition? 10
- 11 Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 12 Q. And what was the substance of that 13 conversation that you had with Mastroianni?
- The length of the deposition. Some of the content. That was pretty much -- we didn't go into a 16 whole lot of depth as to what -- what he was 17 questioned about or anything.
- 18 What did he tell you about the content of 19 his deposition?
- 20 He -- he said there were a lot of what-if Α 21 questions and, of course, Major Byerly said the same 22 thing. I really can't remember any specifics that he 23 told me.
- 24 Okay. And in your conversation with Q. 25 Mastroianni yesterday about his deposition, what was **GILBERT & JONES**

- 1 Did Byerly give you any advice about how
 - to answer questions during the deposition?
 - Α. No, ma'am.

2

3

6

- 4 Did Mastroianni give you any advice about
- 5 how to answer questions during your deposition?
 - Α. No, ma'am.
- 7 Q. Have you reviewed any audio recordings in 8 preparation for this deposition?
- 9 Α. No, ma'am.
- 10 Q. Have you reviewed any transcripts?
- 11 Α. No, ma'am.
- 12 Anything else that you did to prepare for Q. 13 today's deposition that we haven't already discussed?
- 14 No, ma'am. Α.
- 15 So when did you first become sheriff of Q. 16 Camden County?
- 17 Α. I was elected in 2012 and seated January 18 2013.
- 19 Ο. And was that your first term as sheriff?
- 20 Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 21 And are you now in your second term, third Q. 22 term?
- 23 I'm in my third term, starting my third Α. 24 term.
- 25 Q. Okay. And what are your general duties **GILBERT & JONES**

12

- the content of that conversation?
- 2 Α. It was very brief. It was basically about 3 the time and pretty much it.
- 4 The time meaning how long the deposition 5 was?
- 6 Α. Yes, ma'am.
 - And you said you also spoke with Q.
- 8 Colonel Byerly about his deposition; right?
- 9 Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 10 Q. And when did you speak to him?
- 11 Α. Ma'am?
- 12 Q. When did you speak to Byerly about his 13 deposition?
- 14 Α. Yesterday afternoon.
- Q. 15 And what was the content of that conversation? 16
- 17 Α. He told -- it was about what-if questions,
- the time, the amount, how long the deposition took, 18 19 that it was like what-if they were shooting downrange
- 20 but they turned around and shot in a different
- 21 direction.
- 22 The fact that there's a hunting club
- 23 behind the -- the community. I can't even remember

GILBERT & JONES

- the name of the little neighborhood. I -- I can't 24
 - remember much on the specifics beyond that.

- and responsibilities as sheriff? 1
- 2 Enforce the laws of the state of Georgia and to uphold the morals of the community, to run the county jail, and to act as the arm and the sword of 4
- 5 the court.
- 6 Do all of the employees of the Camden Ο. 7 County Sheriff's Office ultimately report to you?
- 8 Α. When you say report to me, what do you
- 9 mean?
- 10 Q. Are you at the top of the organizational
- 11 chart? Does everybody report up to you?
- 12 Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 13 And before you were elected sheriff in
- 14 2012, were you already employed by the Camden County
- **Sheriff's Office?** 15

16

Α.

- Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 17 And when did you first start your employment with the Camden County Sheriff's Office? 18
- 19 Α. I believe it was in 1987. It may have
- 20 been '88.
- 21 Q. Can you just walk me through the different 22 positions that you've held up until the time you were 23 elected sheriff.
- 24 I started out as a jailer; went to Α 25 dispatch; from dispatch to court security; court

- 1 security to patrol. While on patrol, I decided to run for public office. I was -- I had to resign my 2 3 deputy's commission.
- 4 As a civilian, I was put in as the 5 assistant jail administrator. It was the only open 6 position at the time. From there to jail 7 administrator, and I sat in that position for 14 8 years until such time as my predecessor was elected.
- 9 I was stripped of my rank and my pay cut in half and sent across the street as a bailiff. I 10 staved for three years. It was a hostile work 11 12 environment. So I resigned and went to work for 13 Brunswick Police Department as a patrol officer. At
- 14 which time I decided that I would run for sheriff. 15 And ran and was elected and back at the Camden County
- 16 Sheriff's Office. I was gone for approximately nine months. 17
- 18 Q. Okay. So when you were the jail 19 administrator, you said that was for 14 years?
- 20 Α Yes, ma'am.
- 21 Q. And what were those years? From when to
- 22 when?

6

- 23 I don't know. Α.
- 24 Q. Approximately.
- 25 Let's see. Tommy would have been -- so Α. **GILBERT & JONES**

- the investigator showed up. I didn't call him. And 2 it was on a suicide.
- 3 Q. Other than that incident, which was, you 4 said, removed from your file, your record; is that 5 right?
- 6 Α. I -- I believe that it was.
- 7 Q. Other than that incident, have you had any other disciplinary action against you while working 8 9 for the Camden County Sheriff's Office?
- 10 No, ma'am. Α.

11

16

17

18

19

20

22

2

8

14

16

- All right. Q.
- 12 Α. Excuse me.
- 13 Q. Is one of the policies of the Camden 14 County Sheriff's Office to serve and protect the 15 residents of Camden County?
 - Α. Yes, ma'am.
 - Q. And as part of that responsibility of the sheriff's office, is it important that the sheriff's deputies treat the members of the community with respect?
- 21 Α. Yes, ma'am.
 - Q. And why is that important?
- 23 Because it's the right thing to do. Α.
- 24 Treating community members with respect, Ο. 25 does that assist the sheriff's office in any way in

GILBERT & JONES

18

- I'm -- 2008, back 14 years. 1
- 2 Q. Okay.
- 3 Α. And that's a guesstimation.
- 4 Okay. So 2008 was when you were, I guess, 5
 - demoted to bailiff?
 - Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 7 Q. And during what period of time were you 8 working for the Brunswick Police Department? You 9 said it was about nine months. But what years?
- 10 Α. March of -- March of 2012 and was elected 11 in November of 2012. Seated in January of '13.
- 12 Q. As sheriff --
- 13 Yes, ma'am. Α.
- 14 Ο. -- of Camden County?
- 15 Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 16 Q. Okay. And either working for the Camden
- 17 **County Sheriff's Office or for the Brunswick Police**
- Department, have you ever had any disciplinary action 18
- 19 against you?
- 20 Α. Not at Brunswick. At Camden County 21 Sheriff's Office, it would have been 25 years ago or
- 22 so, I'm guessing. There was a policy that had been
- 23 put in place that before you can call an
- investigator, you had to ask your supervisor. I was 24
- 25 written up for that, but it was later removed because **GILBERT & JONES**

- performing its functions? 1
 - Α. I don't understand.
- 3 Is the sheriff's office better able to perform its functions if it treats community members 4 5 with respect?
- 6 Α. Yes, ma'am. It usually elicits better 7 cooperation.
 - Q. From the members of the community?
- 9 Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 10 Is it important that members of the Q.
- 11 community feel a sense of trust in the sheriff's
- 12 office?
- 13 Absolutely. Yes. Α.
 - Q. And why is that?
- 15 Α. Without trust, there's no foundation.
 - When you say "no foundation," what do you Q.
- 17 mean?
- 18 Our standing in the community as Α. 19 professional law enforcement.
- 20 Is it difficult for the sheriff's office 21 to do its job if the members of the community don't 22 trust the sheriff's office?
- 23 I believe that it would be. Fortunately, 24 we don't have that problem.
 - Is it important that members of the **GILBERT & JONES**

- 1 community feel that they can safely contact the 2 sheriff's office for help?
- 3 A. **Absolutely.**

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

1

4

5

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

- 4 Q. And why is that important?
- 5 A. It's back to the trust issue. They have 6 to be able to trust us and feel comfortable to reach 7 out to us.
 - Q. And if community members are afraid to contact the sheriff's office, how does that impair your office's ability to perform its functions?
 - A. I honestly don't know because we don't have that problem.
 - Q. But do you believe it would impair your functioning if the members of the community didn't trust the sheriff's office?
- 16 A. I believe that it would.
- 17 Q. How long have you been aware of 18 Mrs. Emma Jane Prospero as a resident of Woodbine, 19 Georgia?
- A. I think my first contact with her would have been not long after I was seated as sheriff.
- 22 Q. So sometime in 2013?
- 23 A. I'm guessing.
- Q. Okay. So before becoming sheriff, have
- you had any interactions or knowledge of her?
 GILBERT & JONES
 - 20

- A. **No.**
- Q. And what do you recall being your firstsort of introduction to her?
 - A. I honestly don't remember.
 - Q. Sorry. You're getting quiet.
- 6 A. I'm sorry. I honestly don't remember what
 7 the first contact was. Whether it was a phone call
 8 or -- I don't know. I don't remember.
- 9 Q. Okay. So since 2013 and the present, how 10 many times would you estimate that you've interacted 11 with Mrs. Prospero?
 - A. I'm going to guess a couple of times on the phone. She and her husband came to my office one time that I can remember. And I went to their residence one time.
 - Q. Okay. So the couple of times that you've interacted with her over the phone, can you tell me when the last time was?
 - A. I have no idea. I can't remember.
- Q. Can you give me an estimate of how long ago it was?
- A. I'm going to say it's been more than a year ago.
- Q. Was it prior to her arrest?
- 25 A. **Oh, yes, ma'am.**

GILBERT & JONES

- Q. Okay. So she was arrested in January of 2 2019, which was more than two years ago. So would 3 your last contact with her on the phone have been 4 more than two years ago?
 - A. Yes, ma'am.

5

8

11

12

13

14

20

25

4

5

6

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

- Q. And what was your last contact on thephone with her about?
 - A. I don't remember.
- 9 Q. Do you remember any of like general nature 10 of what it was about?
 - A. I'm sure it was either about the ornamental ducks in the pond or else gunshots.
 - Q. And why do you say you're sure it was about one of those two topics?
- 15 A. Because those were the topics discussed 16 whenever we would talk.
- Q. Okay. And the times on the phone with her prior to this last time, there was some time years ago, what were those earlier phone contacts about?
 - A. They would be the ducks or the gunshots.
- Q. And you said Mrs. Prospero and her husband came to your office on one occasion; is that right?
- 23 A. **Yes, ma'am.**
- 24 Q. And approximately when was that?
 - A. I'm going to guess somewhere in either

GILBERT & JONES

22

- 2013 or '14. And like I say, I'm guessing.
- Q. I understand. And so that would have beenpretty early on in your tenure as sheriff?
 - A. Yes, ma'am.
 - Q. And when the Prosperos came to your office, what was the subject of the meeting?
- 7 A. Gunshots in the neighborhood, in the 8 surrounding wooded area, about -- I can't remember 9 the neighbor's name that had built a range in his 10 backyard.
 - Q. And this in-person meeting in your office, did it cover any other topic areas besides gunshots and the neighbor who built the target range?
 - A. Not that I can recollect.
 - Q. Did it involve the concerns that Mrs. Prospero had with her neighbor Stacy Hamilton?
 - A. I don't recall that being part of when they came by. When I paid a visit to their residence, her name was brought up and she was discussed.
- 21 Q. Mrs. Hamilton was discussed?
- 22 A. **Yes, ma'am.**
- 23 Q. **Okay.**
- 24 A. I believe that's her last name. I just --
- 25 I remember Stacy.

1 Okay. So sticking for a minute with the 2 meeting in your office, what was the outcome of that 3 meeting with the Prosperos?

23

- It was a very long meeting. She -- "she" being Mrs. Prospero -- talked guite a bit. I just --I remember the gunshots being a major topic.
- And how did you leave it with them at the end of that meeting?
 - Α. I honestly don't remember.
- Had you invited them for that meeting or 10 how did that meeting come about? 11
- 12 I think they called my assistant and made Δ 13 an appointment to come by.
 - Is that something that you do as part of your duties as sheriff? You meet with community members who want to see you?
- 17 Α. Yes, ma'am.

4

5

6

7

8

9

14

15

16

25

1

2

10

11

12

15

- 18 And that meeting in your office, was that 19 before or after the letter that you wrote to them 20 that you reviewed today?
- 21 Α. It would have been before.
- 22 Ο. And so that letter -- let's go ahead and 23 mark that as Plaintiff's Exhibit 35. This is Bates No. P52. 24

GILBERT & JONES

(Plaintiff's Exhibit 35 was marked for identification.)

- 3 (By Ms. Norins) And just for the record, 4 the letter is dated May 10th, 2017.
- 5 Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 6 So your in-person meeting with the 7 Prosperos in your office would have been before that 8 date?
- 9 Α.
 - O. Okay. And then the time that you went to the Prospero's home to meet with them, when was that approximately?
- 13 Α. It would have been before this letter was 14 written.
 - Q. Before May 10th, 2017?
- 16 Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 17 And did the meeting with them at their home happen before or after the meeting in your 18
- office? 19
- 20 Α. After.
- 21 Q. And what was the subject of the meeting 22 where you went to their home?
- 23 It initiated that there was, I believe, 24 that there was a gunshot that -- or a bullet that
- 25 broke one of the windows in the house.

GILBERT & JONES

- Q. And did you go out to look at the window?
 - Α. I did.

1

2

3

9

10

11

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

22

23

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

24

- Q. What did you observe?
- 4 It was a window facing the pond behind the Α. 5 house. It was a double-pane window. The interior 6 pane was broken but the exterior pane was intact. So 7 it had to have been broken from the inside, not a 8 gunshot from the outside.
 - Okay. And did you go alone to meet with the Prosperos or was anyone from the sheriff's office with you?
- 12 Α. I was by myself.
 - Q. Do you recall an incident where the Prosperos reported a window on one of their outbuildings being broken by a bullet or shattered by a bullet?
 - Α. No. I don't recall that. Excuse me.
 - And you said that the neighbor Stacy was also a subject of this meeting at your -- or at the home of the Prosperos; is that right?
- 21 Α. Yes, ma'am.
 - Q. And what did you discuss with them regarding the neighbor Stacy?
- 24 Mrs. Prospero -- well, Mr. Prospero was 25 there with us, but Mrs. Prospero was complaining

GILBERT & JONES

25

about the ornamental ducks in the community pond 1 2 defecating on her dock, and that Stacy was somehow 3 harboring these ducks. That they would come to her 4 in the evening and she would release them back in the 5 morning and -- excuse me.

And she was complaining about some of the yard art that Stacy had in her backyard, like a mirror or something, that basically the Prosperos didn't like it.

- Okay. Did the Prosperos or Mrs. Prospero Q. ever speak to you about Stacy assaulting her?
- No, ma'am. She had made mention that when the -- they first moved there, that they were friends. But for some reason, they became not friends. But I don't know any of the details.
- Did Mrs. Prospero mention anything about Stacy's mother who also, I guess, lived next door, assaulting her, meaning assaulting Mrs. Prospero?
- Α. No, ma'am. Not that I recollect.
- And it's my understanding that the Prosperos and this neighbor, Stacy, had reciprocal stay-away orders. I don't know what it's called technically in Camden County, but stay-away orders from each other. Were you involved in any of that?
 - Α. No, ma'am. I don't know anything about **GILBERT & JONES**

1 it.

2

1

3

4 5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

25

- Q. Okay. Sorry? You're getting really soft.
- A. I'm sorry. No, ma'am. I don't know anything about it.
- 5 Q. **Okay.**
- 6 A. I'm sorry.
- 7 Q. Oh, I think they're called good behavior
- 8 bonds. Does that sound right?
- 9 A. Yes, ma'am. Good behavior bonds do exist.
- 10 O. And what is a good behavior bond?
- 11 A. It would be where a magistrate orders them
- 12 to stay away from each other, to basically behave.
- 13 They put up a bond. And if they violate it, they
- $\,$ $\,$ $\,$ $\,$ forfeit the bond and would have to put up another $\,$
- 15 one, is my understanding.
- Q. Okay. And do you recall anything about
 the Prosperos and this neighbor Stacy having good
- 18 behavior bonds against each other?
- 19 A. **No, ma'am. I don't know anything about** 20 **that.**
- Q. Okay. What was the outcome of your meeting with the Prosperos at their home?
- 23 A. I -- I -- when you say "the outcome,"
- 24 what -- what do you mean?
- Q. What was the resolution of the meeting or GILBERT & JONES

- 1 Q. You've called these ducks ornamental.
 - A. They're not wild ducks.
- Q. Okay. So somebody put them there on the pond?

29

- A. Yes, ma'am.
- 6 Q. And who was that?
- 7 A. I have no idea.
 - Q. So it was possibly the neighbor Stacy who put them there?
 - A. I have no idea.
 - Q. And the allegation about the Prosperos -- withdrawn.

The Prospero's allegation about their fish being killed, what led you to believe that was frivolous?

- A. There was nothing to substantiate it other than an allegation.
- 18 Q. Did you speak to the person they made the 19 allegation against?
 - A. No, ma'am. I chose not to.
- Q. If someone comes on somebody else's property and kills animals on the person's property, is that a law enforcement issue?
- A. Allegation of it or if it actually happened?

28

27

2

5

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

20

4

7

12

13

14

20

24

25

the results of the meeting?

A. Well, they -- they discussed the ornamental ducks. They didn't like some of the yard art in Stacy's backyard. They allege that another neighbor had killed their ornamental fish in their fish pond. That somebody had put a fence across the property line onto their property.

I basically listened to their complaints, but nothing was done on my behalf afterwards.

- Q. Did you interview any of these neighbors that they reported having issues with?
- A. No, ma'am. From my determination, it was all frivolous.
 - Q. And how did you determine that?
- A. Just by being there. I mean, the window being broken from the inside, not the outside, and them alleging that it was shot with a firearm.

The ornamental ducks that are in the community pond that they're a part of is just -- the ducks were pooping on their dock, and they didn't like that. But they wanted, for some reason, law enforcement to remove the ducks. It just -- it's very frivolous.

- 24 Q. **Who --**
 - A. Those are not law enforcement concerns.

 GILBERT & JONES

- Q. Well, is that an alleged crime? If I
 report someone came on my property and killed my
 animals on my property, would I be alleging a crime?
 - A. Yes, you would be alleging a crime.
- Q. And would it be a kind of crime that thesheriff's office has jurisdiction to look into?
 - A. Sure.
- Q. And so why did you not look intoMrs. Prospero's allegation of that sort of crime?
- 10 A. I looked at the fish pond and there were 11 fish in there. They weren't dead.
 - Q. Had they replaced the fish that had been killed or allegedly been killed?
 - A. I have no idea.
- Q. And the allegation about the neighbor having put a fence onto their property, the Prospero's property, is that kind of allegation something the sheriff's office has jurisdiction to look into?
 - A. That would be a civil matter.
- Q. Would that be considered any sort of trespass if you put a fence on someone else's property?
 - A. I wouldn't consider it a trespass.
 - Q. And so if it's a civil matter, who would GILBERT & JONES

you refer the Prosperos to to address that issue of the fence put on their property?

31

- 3 Α. I'm sorry. They would need to hire an 4 attorney.
 - Okay. So to sum up, when you met with Q. them at their house, you listened to their concerns and you took no further action?
 - A. Correct.

1

2

5

6

7

8

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

2

3

4 5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

25

- 9 Q. Okay. So we've talked about a couple of 10 phone calls that you had with the Prosperos, a meeting at your office and a meeting at their home. 11 Any other contacts that you had with Mrs. Prospero? 12
- 13 No, not that I can recall.

Well, would you consider writing the letter a contact?

- Well, let's talk about the letter. What prompted you to write this letter that's dated May 10th, 2017, that we've marked as Plaintiff's Exhibit 35, and is Bates No. P52?
- Α. After multiple phone calls to my office, the 911 center, the dispatch, multiple, multiple phone calls, and it always seemed as though they were targeting the neighbors for various things, either the ornamental ducks, a lot about the shooting.

It seemed as though she was trying to use **GILBERT & JONES**

32

ducks. That if they wanted to have them removed,

2 they would have to capture them on their property and

3 then have them removed. They couldn't go on the 4 other people's property to do that.

- And how would they have them removed?
- 6 Α. Call animal control.

5

7

8

9

10

11

14

15

16 17

18

19

20

21

22

23

8

13

14

15

16

Q. Okay. And then the letter continues in the second paragraph: "In your e-mail, you've stated I've made promises about protecting you from your neighbor Stacy." So what e-mail are you referring to?

12 Apparently she sent an e-mail to my office 13 or to me. I don't recall what her e-mail said.

MS. NORINS: We would call for production of the e-mail that is referenced in the Sheriff's May 10th, 2017, letter to Mrs. Prospero.

(By Ms. Norins) And then the letter continues: "However, I've told you if you feel threatened to call 911 and a deputy will be dispatched to your location."

So what did you mean by the term "threatened," "if you feel threatened"?

24 Α. That's what it says, "if you feel 25 threatened."

GILBERT & JONES

34

my office to further her interests in the 1 neighborhood. Such as the shooting, she was apparently very opposed to anybody shooting anywhere in the neighborhood, even in the adjoining wooded lands.

And I was trying to impress upon her the fact that the 911 center, you know, this is for emergencies. This other number's for nonemergencies.

- Okay. So looking at the letter, it starts out: "Mr. and Mrs. Prospero, I have assigned Chief Deputy Charles Byerly to your case." And so when you say "your case," what were you referring to?
- Well, there wasn't a formal case number assigned, as far as I knew. But just to their concerns, their complaints, I had asked Chuck, the chief deputy, to look into them. And that when they called, if there was a complaint, they need to ask for him and go to him with it.
- Q. Okay. And then the letter continues: "He will be handling any questions and concerns you may have." And then you continue: "We have addressed the duck situation."

23 So what did you mean by "we have addressed 24 the duck situation"?

> I told them that they were ornamental **GILBERT & JONES**

- And would that include any -- any kind of 1 Q. threat? Verbal? Physical? Written?
- Sure. 3 Α.
- And would that same advice to call 911 if 5 you feel threatened apply if the source of the threat 6 was something other than the neighbor,
- 7 **Stacy Hamilton?**
 - Α. Sure. Any threat.
- 9 So if the Prosperos felt that their safety 10 was threatened, would it be appropriate for them to 11 contact the sheriff's office?
- Α. Yes, ma'am. 12
 - And if the Prosperos felt their safety was threatened, would it be appropriate for them to contact 911?
 - Α. Sure.
- 17 Then your letter continues: "I will not 18 allow you or anyone else to use my office to further 19 your personal agendas. If you have an emergency, call our 911 center." 20

21 And so how do you define emergency as you 22 used it in the context of your letter to the **Prosperos?**

23

24 I don't know what you're looking for. I Α. 25 don't understand your question.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

- Q. How do you define the term "emergency"?
 - A. An emergent situation. I mean --

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

1

2

4

5

6

7

8

9

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

Q. Emergent means developing. So that's a little bit different than emergency. How would you define the term emergency?

MR. WATKINS: I'm going to object to form, Clare. He just gave you an answer and you didn't like it, and then you asked the same question because you redefined the word he gave you.

- Q. (By Ms. Norins) So your definition of emergency is an emerging situation?
- A. An emergent situation. It's an emergency. I mean, I don't understand how you want me to define an emergency. I'd have to get a dictionary.
- Q. Well, in your role as the sheriff, do you have to make determinations about what is an emergency and what isn't in order to allocate your resources?
- 20 A. Occasionally, yes, ma'am.
- Q. And so how do you define emergency for such purposes?
- A. If it's an emergency, something that needs immediate attention.
- Q. Is the term emergency a somewhat GILBERT & JONES

someone is standing too close to your home or the bullets are coming too close to your home and shooting, could that be considered an emergency?

 $\ensuremath{\mathsf{MR}}.$ WATKINS: Object to form. Compound question.

- A. If the bullets are -- if they're aiming at your home and shooting, that could be an emergency. But if they're just shooting a gun and the sound bothers you, that's not an emergency.
- Q. (By Ms. Norins) Okay. When folks call 911 in Camden County -- well, withdrawn.

Is there any expectation that people living in Camden County be able to determine for themselves whether a situation is an emergency or not before contacting the sheriff's office?

- A. Yeah. Could you rephrase it. I don't understand what you're saying -- what you're asking.
- Q. Well, are -- are citizens or residents of the county expected to be able to determine what is an emergency versus what is not an emergency before they contact the sheriff's office?
 - A. Yeah. Yes, ma'am, I believe so.
- Q. Okay. And how are they expected to determine what is an emergency versus what is not an emergency?

GILBERT & JONES

38

- subjective word? Can it mean different things to different people?
- 3 A. Yes, ma'am.
 - Q. So a situation that one person perceives to be an emergency to someone else may not seem like an emergency; is that fair?
 - A. I suppose so. Yes, ma'am.
 - Q. Could gunshots coming too close to your home be legitimately considered an emergency?
- 10 A. Gunshots coming too close to your home, 11 are you referring to the sound?
 - Q. If someone is shooting a gun too close to your home, could that legitimately be considered an emergency?

MR. WATKINS: Object to form. The witness is confused as to what you're asking. He's asked for a clarification. You haven't provided it.

MS. NORINS: I believe I just did. Could you read back the last question, Annette.

(The record was read by the reporter as requested.)

- A. Again, are you talking about sound or bullets?
- 25 Q. (By Ms. Norins) I'm talking about if GILBERT & JONES

- A. Common sense.
- Q. And if a resident has a good-faith belief
 that something is an emergency and calls 911, and the
 sheriff's office disagrees and says, no, that's not
 an emergency, would that constitute any kind of
 unlawful conduct by the citizen for having called
 y11?
 - A. Single phone call or harassing phone calls?
 - Q. If they call 911 because they believe there's an emergency and the sheriff's office's disagrees and says, no, that's not an emergency, would that constitute any unlawful conduct by the person who made the call?
 - A. Again, a single phone call or multiple harassing phone calls?
 - Q. This question is proposing a single phone call. If they call and it's -- they think it's an emergency but the sheriff's office says, no, it's not, is there anything unlawful about their having called 911?
 - A. It still could be.
- 23 Q. It still could be what?
- A. I'm going to have to ask you to ask your question again.

L	MS. NORINS: Annette, can you just read
2	back the last question.

3 (The record was read by the reporter as 4 requested.)

- It could be. It could be unlawful and harassing.
- 7 Q. (By Ms. Norins) Based on a single phone 8 call?
- 9 Α. It's possible, yes, ma'am.

5

6

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- And under what circumstance would that 10 single phone call be unlawful? 11
- 12 If it's harassing, interrupting, Α. 13 disturbing the 911 center and its normal operation.
 - What do you mean by "harassing"?

MR. WATKINS: Objection again to form. I mean, these are plain English words that you you're continually asking him to redefine. You can answer as best you can.

- Harassing is exactly what I said, and that's what it means. Harassing. Common sense.
- 21 (By Ms. Norins) So you're not able to 22 explain any further what harassing means?
- 23 A. It's harassing.
- 24 Okay. So someone who calls 911 one time 25 and says it's an emergency and the sheriff's office

GILBERT & JONES

40

- says, no, it's not, you would consider that harassing?
 - MR. WATKINS: Object to form. That mischaracterizes his testimony. His testimony was that a single phone call could, in a hypothetical situation, be construed as harassing.
- (By Ms. Norins) And so I've asked what do you mean by harassing in that context? How could the one phone call be harassing?
- MR. WATKINS: The witness said if it were 11 12 correct.

THE COURT REPORTER: I'm sorry, Mr. Watkins. Could you repeat that. I couldn't hear you.

MR. WATKINS: I said the witness did as best as he could and said in the circumstances that it would be harassing. The same question's been asked and answered and -- and Clare, you mischaracterized his testimony in restating the auestion.

- (By Ms. Norins) Sheriff Proctor, can you give me an example of what you mean by a single phone call to 911 could be harassing?
- 25 A. Not off the top of my head.

GILBERT & JONES

- Okay. So referring back to your letter of
- 2 May 10th, 2017, that's marked as Plaintiff's Exhibit
- 3 35, you said to the Prosperos, "If you have an
- emergency, call our 911 center, or if you have a
- 5 concern, feel free to call the nonemergency number,
- 912-729-1442." Did I read that correctly?
 - Α. Yes, ma'am.

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

1

7

- And what is that 1442 number? Where does Ο. that call into?
- Α. It's a nonemergency line into 911.
- And you said to the Prosperos, "Call that Q. number if you have a concern." And what did you mean by "a concern" in the context of that letter?
 - If it's not an emergency.
- 15 So any concern that's not an emergency, 16 they should call the 1442 number. Is that what you 17 meant?
- 18 Yes. That's what I meant. That's exactly 19 what the letter says.
- 20 Okay. So if they had a concern about 21 gunshots and it wasn't an emergency, should they call 22 the 1442 number?
- 23 Α. They could.
- 24 Would that be consistent with what your 25 letter advised them to do?

GILBERT & JONES

42

- Α. Sure. If it -- a legitimate concern.
- 2 Q. And the sheriff's office also has a general number that's on the letter. It's up at the 3
- top part of the letterhead, the 912-510-5110 number? 4 5
 - Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 6 And where does that number ring to? Q.
 - The front office. Α.
- 8 Ο. Of the sheriff's office?
- 9 Yes, ma'am. Α.
- 10 And is that also a number that community Q. 11 members can call if they have a concern?
- 12 Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 13 How was this letter, this May 10th, 2017, 14 letter delivered to the Prosperos?
- 15 Α. I'm assuming via U.S. mail, but I honestly don't know. 16
- 17 Okay. Do you recall if you personally handed it to them or brought it to them? 18
 - Α. No, ma'am. Excuse me.
 - All right. I want to refer you to an exhibit that we marked yesterday. Hold on one second. I have to find it. This was previously marked as Plaintiff's Exhibit 24. It's Bates No. 40 through 42.

GILBERT & JONES

25 MR. WATKINS: Clare, these are the

19

20

21

22

23

25

call the sheriff's office?

Yes, ma'am, to the best of my knowledge.

GILBERT & JONES

said that a bullet came right down in front of her.

The sheriff's office just keeps saying that they are

GILBERT & JONES

24

3

4

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

22

23

24

25

2

3

4

5

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- Did you ever use a phrase with 1
- 2 Mrs. Prospero the squeaky wheel gets the oil or the
- 3 squeaky wheel gets the grease?
 - Α. No, ma'am.
 - Q. Is it legal in Camden County for someone to shoot a gun on their own property?
 - Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 8 Are there any limitations on that right to Q. 9 shoot a gun on your own property?
 - As long as it's inside the scope of the law. I mean, Georgia law says that you have to be so far from a public road or it has to be done in a safe manner. I mean, as long as it's within the limitations.
- 15 Q. So there are some limitations on shooting 16 a gun on your own private property?
- 17 As long as it's done safely.
- 18 MR. WATKINS: Do you need to take that 19 call?

4

5

6

7

10

11

12 13

14

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

- 20 THE WITNESS: It's Sheriff Welcher in 21 Savannah.
- 22 MR. WATKINS: Do you want to take that?
- 23 THE WITNESS: No. I'll call him back.
- 24 MR. WATKINS: Clare, we've got -- the
- 25 sheriff has his phone and may get important **GILBERT & JONES**

 - calls. He has other sheriffs calling him. So if we need to pause, I'll just let you know. Okay?
 - MS. NORINS: Okay. Yeah, that's no problem, Sheriff, if you need to take a call or something.
 - (By Ms. Norins) Okay. So you said there are requirements that shooting on your own property be done safely; is that fair to say?
 - Α. Sure. Yes, ma'am.
- 11 Q. And so what are those safety requirements 12 for shooting on your own property?
- 13 It has to be done safely. I mean, you
- 14 can't put someone's life at danger -- in danger.
- 15 Are you allowed to stand on your own property and shoot a gun over onto someone else's 16 17 property?
- Not without the other person's permission, 18 Α 19 I wouldn't believe.
- 20 And you made reference to you can't shoot 21 within a certain distance of a public road or 22 highway?
- 23 Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 24 Q. Can you tell me more about that 25
 - requirement?
- **GILBERT & JONES**

- No, ma'am. It's a Georgia Code section and I don't know it off the top of my head.
- Would the roads in the Runnymeade neighborhood be considered public roads?
- 5 I don't know. I don't know if they're 6 private -- if they were ever deeded to the county or 7 if they're still property of the subdivision. I 8 don't know.
 - So if someone, say the Prosperos, was making a complaint about gunshots in the neighborhood, would that be relevant to look into to whether the roads in that neighborhood are public roads for purposes of the Georgia Code section?
 - I would think that the deputies probably did.
 - Q. Does Camden County have an ordinance on nuisances?
- 18 Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 19 Ο. And does that ordinance define noise as a 20 nuisance that can violate the ordinance?
- 21 I guess. I've never looked at it. Α.
 - Q. Okay. You've never looked at the Camden County ordinances?

MR. WATKINS: Object to form.

I've looked at some of them. I've never Α. **GILBERT & JONES**

50

looked at the noise ordinance. 1

Q. (By Ms. Norins) Okay. So Section 802 Subsection (2)(a) of the Camden County nuisance ordinance says: "The following are declared to be nuisances. Things interfering with peace or comfort, sounds, animals or things that interfere with the peace or comfort or disturb the quiet of the county."

THE COURT REPORTER: I'm sorry,

Mr. Watkins. I can't hear you.

MR. WATKINS: Is this ordinance marked as an exhibit?

MS. NORINS: Well, we can refer to Colonel Byerly's letter that was marked yesterday that contains this section of the county ordinance.

MR. WATKINS: If you're going to ask the witness about it, about the content of it, I'd like him to have it in front of him. If you could give me --

MS. NORINS: Let me just find that exhibit. Hold on. Sorry. Too many exhibits. Hold on.

Okay. It's Exhibit 27, and it's Bates No. P39 through 51. And the Camden County nuisance ordinance appears on the second page of the **GILBERT & JONES**

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

24

letter, P40.

1

2

3

12

13

14

15

16

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR. WATKINS: Okay. Give me a second. Okay. We've got it in front of us.

4 (By Ms. Norins) Okay. So if you see down 5 in the bottom third of that page, P40, it says: 6 "Section 802, enumeration of nuisances." And then 7 Subsection 2: "The following are declared to be 8 nuisances. (A), Things interfering with peace or 9 comfort, sounds, animals or things that interfere with the peace or comfort or disturb the quiet of the 10 county." 11

Do you see that there?

- Α. Yes, ma'am. I see that.
- And would this ordinance, which is a county ordinance, apply in the Runnymeade neighborhood?
- 17 Α. Sure.
- 18 And would this ordinance be a limitation 19 on the right to shoot a gun on your own private 20 property?
- 21 A. Not necessarily.
 - Q. Would you have to be in compliance with this ordinance if you were shooting on your own private property?
 - Α. I quess.

GILBERT & JONES

- So is it possible that shooting on your own property could still disturb the quiet of the county such as would violate this ordinance?
 - Of the general public or an individual?
 - Q. Of anyone.
- I don't believe that the general public was complaining. An individual was complaining. None of the neighbors were.
- And I'm not speaking about the Prosperos in particular. I'm speaking in general. Is it a general limitation on shooting on your own private property that you cannot violate the Camden County ordinance on nuisances?
 - Α. Not necessarily.
- So it's okay to shoot on private property even if it's in violation of the Camden County nuisance ordinance?

MR. WATKINS: That's a different question. I'm going to object to form. You're asking the witness to assume that whatever's happening with shooting is a violation of this ordinance?

MS. NORINS: I'm asking is this ordinance a limitation on the right to shoot on your own private property. Do you still have to comply with the ordinance even if you have a right to

GILBERT & JONES

shoot on your property?

MR. WATKINS: He answered that question. He said, "Not necessarily."

(By Ms. Norins) I don't understand. When you say "not necessarily," that means you don't always have to comply with this Camden County ordinance on nuisances? That it's optional whether you comply with it?

MR. WATKINS: I'm going to object to form.

- I just don't understand your question. I mean, I don't -- I don't know how to answer that.
- (By Ms. Norins) So you don't know how this Camden County ordinance interacts with the right to shoot on your own private property?

MR. WATKINS: You haven't -- you haven't defined the situation you're asking the witness about. You're perfectly within your right to ask him any hypothetical, but give him the facts of the hypothetical.

He told you in general that shooting does not necessarily violate this ordinance. So if you want to drill down on that with any hypothetical, feel free to. But you're not giving him any facts for a hypothetical.

(By Ms. Norins) This is not a hypothetical **GILBERT & JONES**

question. The question is: If you have a right to shoot on your own property, do you still have to also comply with this county ordinance that prohibits noise violations?

MR. WATKINS: I'm going to object to form because that's not what the ordinance says.

- Just because you're shooting on your property doesn't mean that it's a noise violation.
- (By Ms. Norins) I understand. Not every time you shoot on your property is going to be a noise violation.
 - Α. Well, what are you referring to?
- But are you still bound by this ordinance when you're shooting on your own private property? Do you still have to --

Is it --Α.

THE COURT REPORTER: Wait a minute. You talked over each other? Do you still have to?

- (By Ms. Norins) Comply with the county ordinance that prohibits nuisances?
- Is it a public nuisance? I mean, or is it 22 just bothering somebody? I don't understand. Has -has it been declared that somebody shooting on their property, is that a public nuisance? Because if then, the ordinance would come into play.

1 But who's declared it a public nuisance?

2 That I don't understand. I don't know how to answer

55

3 **that.**

4

5

8

14

15

16

17

18

19

20 21

22

1

2

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12 13 Q. Okay. I think we're ships passing each other in the night here.

6 Does this ordinance on nuisances in Camden 7 County, does that apply throughout the county?

- A. I would believe so, yes, ma'am.
- 9 Q. Okay. And if you're creating noise by 10 shooting on your own private property, is there any 11 situation where that could rise to the level of 12 constituting a nuisance under this Camden County
- 13 ordinance?
 - A. Probably, yes.
 - Q. Okay. Can you give me an example of where shooting on your private property would create noise that would rise to the level of violating the Camden County nuisance ordinance?
 - A. "The annoyance of the public in general or as manifestly injurious to the public, health, safety and welfare of the citizens of Camden County." That would be --
- 23 Q. And you're reading from the --
- A. I'm sorry. Yes, ma'am. I'm reading from the code section.

GILBERT & JONES

Q. That appears on P40, which is the second

page of Plaintiff's Exhibit 27?

3 A. Yes, ma'am.

- Q. Okay. In your experience as sheriff or as, you know, a deputy prior to being sheriff, have you ever encountered a situation where gunshots fired on private property violated the Camden County nuisance ordinance?
- 9 A. Not to the best of my knowledge.
 - Q. At any time did you discuss the Camden County nuisance ordinance with the Prosperos as it relates to their complaints about gunshots?
 - A. No, ma'am.
- Q. Okay. And are you aware that on
 Thanksgiving Day of 2018, Deputy Ryan Sullivan
 obtained a warrant for the arrest of Mrs. Prospero?
- 17 A. Am I aware that it occurred now or was I 18 aware of it at the time?
- 19 O. Are you aware of that now?
- 20 A. Yes, ma'am.
- 21 Q. And when did you first become aware that
- 22 Deputy Sullivan had obtained an arrest warrant for
- 23 Mrs. Prospero?
- A. It was sometime after the warrant was
- 25 done. I'm guessing that she was already out of jail GILBERT & JONES

when I found out, but I don't know specifically when it was.

- Q. Were -- were -- excuse me. Were you
 consulted before the arrest warrant for Mrs. Prospero
 was obtained?
- 6 A. **No, ma'am.**

Q.

Α.

7

12

16

17

1

2

4

5

9

10

11

12

13

14 15

16

8 2018. Then she was arrested about two months later 9 on January 28th, 29th of 2019. In between the 10 warrant being obtained and her arrest, were you aware

So it was obtained Thanksgiving Day of

11 that there was a warrant for her?

Not that I recall.

- Q. Did you believe you first learned that there had been a warrant for her arrest after it had been executed and she had been arrested?
 - A. I believe so.
 - Q. And how do you recall learning that?
- 18 A. I don't recall how I learned it. It was 19 probably in conversation with either one of my 20 deputies or part of my office staff.
- Q. Okay. Have you reviewed the affidavit for the arrest warrant for Mrs. Prospero?
- 23 A. **Yes, ma'am.**
- 24 Q. When did you first review it?
- 25 A. **Today.**

GILBERT & JONES

Q. Today? In preparation for your deposition?

- 3 A. Yes, ma'am.
 - Q. Have you seen it before then?
 - A. No, ma'am.
- Q. So let's look at the warrant. Or it's the
 affidavit that is also the warrant. And this
 is Exhibit --

MR. WATKINS: We've been going about an hour and a half or so. Are we at a -- it sounds like we're about to get into another area that's going to take some time. Are we at a point we can take a break?

MS. NORINS: Why don't we finish this and then we can take a break, finish this exhibit, if that's okay.

17 MR. WATKINS: What exhibit? What Bates 18 number is it?

MS. NORINS: It's Plaintiff's Exhibit 13,
 Bates No. 157 to 158.

Q. (By Ms. Norins) Do you need a chance to read it again, Sheriff?

A. I glanced at it. I just -- I haven't read it in depth yet.

Q. Do you want to take a moment and read it GILBERT & JONES

24

25

you read it back.

requested.)

(The record was read by the reporter as

GILBERT & JONES

MS. NORINS: Took oral testimony from the

THE COURT REPORTER: Thank you.

GILBERT & JONES

23

24

25

officer.

- MR. WATKINS: Objection. 1
- 2 Α. I don't believe that it should be.
- 3 Q. (By Ms. Norins) Is it okay for an arrest 4 warrant affidavit to present facts in a way that are 5 misleading to the judge?
- 6 Α. No, ma'am.
- 7 Is it okay for an arrest warrant affidavit 8 to present facts in a way that misrepresents what happened? 9
 - Α. No, ma'am.

- Ο. All right. So looking at Plaintiff's 11
- Exhibit 13, which is the warrant for -- or the 12
- 13 affidavit and the warrant, I quess, for
- Mrs. Prospero's arrest, there were two months that 14
- 15 elapsed between the warrant being obtained -- about
- 16 two months that elapsed between the warrant being
- obtained and the warrant being executed. 17

18 Is there any time at which a warrant would 19 expire if it's not executed?

- 20 Α. I don't -- I don't know.
- 21 Ο. Okay.
- 22 Α. I don't believe so.
- 23 Okay. So your understanding is that the
- 24 warrant could be executed even years after it was
- 25 obtained?

1

2

3

7

8

GILBERT & JONES

63

- Α. I've seen that happen in the past.
- Q. Okay. So based on your review of the affidavit for the warrant and the warrant itself, is
- the probable cause or alleged probable cause in this 4
- 5 case based only on events that occurred Thanksgiving
- Day 2018? 6
 - Α. If November 22nd was Thanksgiving Day, then, yes, ma'am.
- 9 Okay. So this warrant just concerns the 10 events of November 22nd, 2018, and not prior events; 11 is that correct?
- Α. 12 I believe that's correct.
- 13 And so this was an affidavit that alleged
- 14 Mrs. Prospero had engaged in unlawful conduct during
- a 911 call on November 22nd, 2018. Is that fair to 15
- say? 16

19

- 17 It appears to me that it's multiple calls,
- not just single call. 18
- Okay. So with regard to -- it's undisputed by the parties that Mrs. Prospero called 20
- 21 911 one time on November 22nd, 2018. Can you tell
- 22 from this affidavit how long that 911 call lasted?
- 23 MR. WATKINS: You're referring to the
- 24 third contact? 25
 - (By Ms. Norins) I'm just asking based on **GILBERT & JONES**

- the affidavit, can you tell how long Mrs. Prospero's 911 call lasted? 2
- 3 Α. Not -- no, ma'am, not necessarily. I -- I 4 can't determine how long the -- each call lasted.
- 5 Okay. So do you see down at the bottom of 6 the first page, which is Bates No. 157, it says: "At 7 1458 hours, Mrs. Prospero contacted 911 stating that she wanted the shooting from the hunting club to 8 9 stop." Do you see that sentence?
 - Yes, ma'am. Α.

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

25

2

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15 16

17

18

20

- Q. So does that tell us when the 911 call started?
 - Α. I believe so. Yes, ma'am.
- Okay. And is there any statement in the Q. warrant of when that call ended?
- No, ma'am. I don't see anything. It would have ended prior to 3:15 because that's when the deputy was at the residence.
- Okav. Do 911 operators sometimes stay on the line with a caller until the officer arrives at the location?
 - Α. Depending on the situation, yes, ma'am.
- 23 Q. That does happen sometimes?
- 24 Α. It has happened, yes, ma'am.
 - Okay. So the fact that the officer had Q.

GILBERT & JONES

65

arrived at the Prospero's residence at 3:15, does that establish that the call had ended by 3:15?

- Not necessarily. I would -- I would assume that it was -- the phone call had been over because it says that 911 attempted to call them back, and that they wouldn't answer the phone.
- But we don't know from the affidavit when the 911 call -- 911 call actually ended. You're making an assumption about that. Is that fair to say?
- From what I'm reading, yes, ma'am. I mean, it -- it states what time the deputy's there and he asked 911 to call.
- So you're assuming from that that the 911 call had ended at that time?
- Yes. It ended prior to that because at Α. that time he was asking 911 to call them.
- Does it say how long the deputy was at the Q. residence? 19
 - Α. No, ma'am.
- 21 Okay. So looking at the beginning of the 22 affidavit where it says: "Unlawful conduct" -- this
- 23 is in the very first little paragraph -- "unlawful
- 24 conduct during 911 call on November 22nd, 2018, at
 - 2:58 p.m., to November 22nd, 2018, at 3:30 p.m. in

- 1 Camden County, Georgia."
- 2 And what -- what do you understand that 3 time period to encompass between 2:58 p.m. and 3:30 4 p.m.?
- 5 A. I would say that that time frame is when 6 she violated the law.
 - Q. Okay.

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1

3

4

5

6

7

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

- 8 Α. That was when she had made multiple phone 9 calls.
- Well, it is undisputed that she made the 10 one phone call to 911. 11

MR. WATKINS: Object. I'm going to object. I'm going to object because you're representing that we have made a stipulation that is at the heart of the case and is such a finesse point about a call versus a contact. You're asking the witness to look at this affidavit that talks about other communications with dispatch, and then you're telling the witness we've stipulated that there's one call.

Well --

MS. NORINS: Well, one call to 911.

MR. WATKINS: I just think that's a little bit misleading how you're phrasing that,

25 but . . .

GILBERT & JONES

MS. NORINS: Okay.

2 MR. WATKINS: I'm going to object to form.

MS. NORINS: I understand the objection.

- (By Ms. Norins) So, Sheriff, with respect to this time period of 2:58 p.m. on November 22nd, 2018, to 3:30 p.m., do you understand that to be the time of the call to 911?
- 8 Α. No.
- 9 Ο. So what do you understand that time period 10 to describe?
 - Α. That time frame shows that Ms. Prospero violated the law by making multiple contacts with the 911 center. That's the time frame when the violations occurred.
 - Q. And so you understand those contacts to have started at 2:58 p.m. and to have lasted until 3:30 p.m.?
- I would, from reading the body of the 18 19 warrant, I would say that the violations, the first 20 contact was at 2:42.
- 21 Okay. So you think that time period up at 22 the top is wrong? It should start at 2:42 p.m., not 23 2:58 p.m.?
- 24 Α If I wrote the warrant, yes, ma'am, that's 25 the way I would write it.

GILBERT & JONES

Q. And then where does the 3:30 p.m. come

from? 2

10

11

12

13

14

19

20

22

23

24

25

4

7

8

17

21

68

67

3 I don't know. You'd have to ask Α. 4 Deputy Sullivan.

- 5 Well, if he's specifying that's the time 6 frame when the offense ended, shouldn't that be stated in the body of the affidavit what that 3:30 7 time signifies? 8
- 9 Α. No, ma'am.
 - Q. That shouldn't be included?
 - I -- it -- no. No, ma'am. Α.
 - So how is the judge to know what that 3:30 p.m. time signifies if it's not stated in the body of the affidavit what it signifies?
- 15 Α. You'd have to ask the magistrate judge. I don't know. 16
- 17 Q. But as you sit here reading it, you don't 18 know what that 3:30 p.m. time refers to?
 - No, I don't. No, ma'am, I don't.
- Okay. So this has been stipulated, I Ο. 21 think we can agree, the 911 call that Mrs. Prospero made on November 22nd, 2018, lasted about two and a half minutes. Can you tell that from reading this arrest warrant affidavit?
 - I don't see that written anywhere in here. Α.

GILBERT & JONES

69

- Would that be relevant to include if 1 you're charging someone with unlawful conduct during 3 a 911 call?
 - Α. No, ma'am.
- 5 Ο. So the duration of the call would not be relevant, you're saying? 6
 - Α. Not necessarily.
 - Ο. Why wouldn't it be relevant?
- 9 If you called the 911 center and hang up, 10 the duration of the call has nothing to do if you do it multiple times. 11
- 12 Okay. So this charges Ms. Prospero, if 13 you see the second paragraph of the affidavit, which 14 is on page 157, it says: "Said events being 15 described as 16-11-39.2 misdemeanor unlawful conduct during a 911 call." 16

And it says: "For the said Emma Jane Prospero did violate O.C.G.A. 16-11-39.2 when he/she 18 19 unlawfully contacted 911, an emergency telephone 20 service, in reference to an incident that was not a true emergency for the purpose of interfering or

22 disrupting an emergency telephone service." 23

Did I read that correctly?

- 24 Yes, ma'am. Α. 25
 - Q. She's been charged with calling for the

4

8

11

12

13

14

15

16 17

21

5

13

16

17

20

- purpose of interfering or disrupting an emergency 1 2 telephone service; correct?
 - Α. That's what the warrant says.
- 4 Okay. And so your testimony is that the Ο. 5 duration of the call to 911 would have no relevance 6 to the charge?
 - A. Not necessarily.
- 8 Q. And in this case, do you think it has any 9 relevance to the charge?
 - No, ma'am. Α.

3

7

10

11

14

15

16

19

20 21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

6

7

8

13

14

15

16 17

18

- And why not? Q.
- 12 It's the multiple contacts with the 911 Α. 13 center of a harassing nature.
 - And what is -- when you say "harassing nature," can you tell me what you mean by that?
 - It's -- it's explained in the warrant.
- 17 Can you tell me where in the warrant, Q. 18 point to the language in the warrant?
 - Read -- read the entire body of the warrant. That explains it. You can't -- you can't take bits and pieces of it. You have to read the entire body, which is what the judge would do. She would read the entire warrant and make a determination whether or not there's probable cause.
 - But the paragraph we looked at where it **GILBERT & JONES**

- MR. WATKINS: It doesn't have that word, 1 2 if that's what you're asking.
 - Α. It does not have that word.
- (By Ms. Norins) Okay. In fact, it just 5 says that she was calling for the purpose of 6 interfering or disrupting an emergency telephone 7 service; correct?
 - That's what the warrant says. Α.
- 9 MS. NORINS: All right. Do you want to 10 take a break?
 - MR. WATKINS: I think so. We've been going close to two hours.
 - MS. NORINS: Okay. Let's take a break. 10 minutes? Longer? I don't know. Tell me what you --
 - MR. WATKINS: We'll take 10 minutes. Are we getting close or no?
- 18 MS. NORINS: I'm not sure.
- 19 MR. WATKINS: Okav. All right. We'll be 20 back in 10 minutes.
 - (Recess from 11:45 a.m. to 12:04 p.m.)
- 22 (By Ms. Norins) Okay. So in discussing 23 the warrants for Ms. Prospero's arrest, you used the 24 word "harassing" a number of times. So I wanted to 25 talk a little bit about the definition of harassing

GILBERT & JONES

- says what she's actually charged with, that second paragraph, does that say anything about harassing?
- It's -- it's -- it's -- I'm using the word 4 harassing. It's the unlawful conduct. I'm saying 5 harassing because I believe that she's harassing the 911 center.
 - Q. Okay.
 - A. Those are my words.
- 9 Understand. But does the warrant allege 10 that she was harassing -- or the affidavit to the 11 warrant, does it allege that she was harassing the 911 operators? 12
 - Well, it's citing the code section. And if you look up the code section, it talks about harassing.
 - Q. But that's a separate code section than what she was actually charged with.
 - MR. WATKINS: Object to form.
- 19 A. I'd have to get a code section out and 20 look at it.
- 21 (By Ms. Norins) Okay. We'll look at that Q. 22 in a little bit. But do you agree with me that that 23 second paragraph where it states the offense that 24 she's being charged with does not say that she was 25 harassing?
 - **GILBERT & JONES**

- under the unlawful conduct statute. 1
- 2 So let's go ahead and mark as Plaintiff's Exhibit 36 the copy of the statute that I e-mailed 4 last night. Do you have that, Brad?
 - MR. WATKINS: Okay.
- 6 (Plaintiff's Exhibit 36 was marked for 7 identification.)
- 8 (By Ms. Norins) Okay. So Plaintiff's 9 Exhibit 36 is not Bates numbered, but it's the text 10 of Georgia Code Section 16-11-39.2, unlawful conduct 11 during a 911 call. Do you have that in front of you, Sheriff? 12
 - Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 14 And do you see under Section (a)(4), it 15 talks about harassing, and it gives a definition?
 - MR. WATKINS: Sorry. My computer's making noises here.
- MS. NORINS: I'm looking at (a)(4) 18 19 "Harassing."
 - MR. WATKINS: Oh, harassing. I'm sorry.
- 21 (By Ms. Norins) Do you see where it says:
- 22 "Harassing means a willful use of opprobrious and 23 abusive language which has no legitimate purpose in
- 24 relation to imparting information relevant to an
- 25 emergency call"?

Α.

1

- 2 Q. Okay. And is there anything in the body 3 of the affidavit, the arrest warrant affidavit for 4 Mrs. Prospero that talks about her use of opprobrious 5 and abusive language?
- 6 Α. No, ma'am.
- 7 So is it fair to say that the arrest warrant affidavit does not accuse Mrs. Prospero as 8 9 harassing when she was contacting 911?

10 MR. WATKINS: Under this definition I presume you're asking. 11

- 12 (By Ms. Norins) Under the definition contained in this statute under which she was 13 14 charged.
- 15 Α. Correct.
- Q. 16 So looking at -- we're just going to keep looking at the statute itself. In Section (b), it 17 says: "A person commits the offense of unlawful 18 19 conduct during a 911 call if he or she," and then it lists various types of conduct. Do you see where I'm 20 21 referring to?
- 22 Α. Yes, ma'am.

23

24

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

19

25

- Is it fair to say that the statute is concerned with the conduct during the 911 call?
- 25 As well as the call itself. It says when **GILBERT & JONES**

1 question, Annette.

2

3

4

5

16

17

18

19

20

22

23

25

13

14

(The record was read by the reporter as requested.)

- Not that I can determine. I'm not an Α. attorney.
- 6 Ο. (By Ms. Norins) As part of your duties as 7 sheriff, do you have to interpret and apply Georgia 8 Code statutes?
- 9 Sure. Α.
- 10 So looking at (b)(1), it says -- this is Q. talking about conduct that could be unlawful during a 11 911 call -- it says: "Without provocation uses 12 13 obscene, vulgar or profane language with the intent 14 to intimidate or harass a 911 communications 15 officer." Did I read that correctly?
 - Α. Yes, ma'am.
 - So is it fair to say that that provision of the statute is concerned with the caller's intent?
 - Yes, ma'am.
- Q. In looking at (b)(2), it says you can also violate this statute by calling or otherwise 21 contacting 911, whether or not a conversation ensues, for the purpose of annoying, harassing or molesting a 24 911 communications officer.

So is it fair to say that provision is **GILBERT & JONES**

76

they contact the 911 center.

- Q. So this statute's concerned with the contact to 911 and what happens during the call itself. Is that fair to say?
- Α. It says whether or not conversation ensues. The contact is for the purpose of annoying, harassing, disrupting. It doesn't -- I'm sorry.
- My question is: Is the statute concerned with the conduct, whether it involves talking or not, during the 911 call?
- Α. It says whether or not conversation ensues. That's what the statute says.
- 13 MS. NORINS: Could you read back the 14 question. You're not answering the question, 15 sir.

MR. WATKINS: Object to that statement. 16 17 (The record was read by the reporter as 18 requested.)

- Α. Yes, that's what the statute says.
- 20 (By Ms. Norins) Does the statute make 21 reference to conduct occurring outside of the 911 22 call?
- 23 I don't understand the question. Is it 24 about the call itself?

MS. NORINS: Can you read back the **GILBERT & JONES**

concerned with the purpose for which the caller 1 2 contacts 911?

3 Α. Yes, ma'am.

4 And that provision -- that provision 5 continues: "Or for the purpose of interfering with or disrupting emergency telephone services." Did I 7 read that correctly?

8 MR. WATKINS: Read it again, if you would, 9 please.

- 10 (By Ms. Norins) "For the purpose of 11 interfering with or disrupting emergency telephone service." 12
 - Α. Yes, ma'am.
 - Q. That's what it says; right?
- (Nods head affirmatively.) 15 Α.
- And is it fair to say that that part of 16
- 17 (b)(2) is concerned with the caller's purpose for contacting 911? 18
- 19 Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 20 And then (b)(3) says you could violate the 21 statute by calling or otherwise contacting 911 and

22 failing to hang up or disengage the connection for

- 23 the intended purpose of interfering with or
- 24 disrupting emergency service. 25

So is it fair to say that that Subsection **GILBERT & JONES**

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

25

1 2

5

6

7

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

19

20

23

25

1 (b)(3) is concerned with the intent of the caller in contacting 911? 2

79

Α. Yes, ma'am.

3

8

9

10

11

1

2

3

4 5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

22

4 Okay. And then (b)(4) says you can also Ο. 5 violate the statute if you call or otherwise contact 6 911 with the intention to harass a communications 7 officer.

And is it fair to say that that section, (b)(4), is concerned with the intent of the caller in contacting 911?

- Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 12 Q. So is it fair to say that all of these 13 provisions, (b)(1), (b)(2), (b)(3) and (b)(4) are 14 concerned with the intent as opposed to the effect of 15 the caller?
- Α. 16 Yes, ma'am.
- 17 Q. And in (b)(2) where it refers to emergency 18 telephone service, what does that mean, emergency 19 telephone service?
- 20 Α. The 911 center.
- 21 Okay. And then Camden County, the 22 emergency telephone service is the Camden County 911 23 dispatch center and the operators who answer the 24 calls there; correct?
- 25 Yes, ma'am. Α.

GILBERT & JONES

And so when it says in (b)(2) that it violates the statute to contact 911 for the purpose of interfering with or disrupting emergency telephone service, that would mean for the purpose of interfering with or disrupting the 911 center or the operators who work there. Is that fair to say? Α. Yes, ma'am.

All right. So turning to the calls that the Prosperos made on November 22nd, 2018, I'm going to refer you first to what we marked as Exhibit 32, which is the transcript from calls on November 22nd, 2018.

13 I'm sorry. That's the wrong exhibit 14 number. It's Exhibit 31, not 32. 15 MR. WATKINS: Okay.

(By Ms. Norins) Okay. So I'll ask you to 16 17 read the first call that's in this transcript. It starts on page 2 at 2:42 p.m. And it's just that one 18 19 page. So you can read that and let me know when 20 vou're done.

21 Α. Okay.

Okay. So this was a call that

23 Mrs. Prospero made by contacting the sheriff office's 24 5100 number, and then she was transferred to the

25 dispatch center. Do you have any reason to

GILBERT & JONES

disbelieve that that's what occurred?

There's nothing written here to indicate where the number came in.

4 Right. I understand you can't tell from the transcript, but the testimony in this case so far -- well, withdrawn.

Mrs. Prospero reports that she called the 5100 number and was transferred to the Camden County dispatch center. Do you have any reason to disbelieve that that's how this call was initiated?

MR. WATKINS: He doesn't know. Just get him to assume that's the case and we can move past it, if you don't mind.

(By Ms. Norins) Well, no, I just want to know if he has any reason to doubt that that's what occurred.

Α. Not by what I'm reading here. It doesn't indicate in any way.

And does that sound like the right procedure that if someone contacted the 5100 number of the sheriff's office and had a complaint or concern about something in the community, that they would then be transferred to the dispatch center?

24 Α. Probably, yes, ma'am.

> Okay. And that would be done at the Q. **GILBERT & JONES**

> > 82

discretion of the person answering the 5100 number?

Α. It depends. If it's a holiday or the weekends when the front office is closed, it rings over to the jail. The jail would transfer it to the 911 center.

Okay. All right. So looking at the transcript, Mrs. Prospero states: "Yes. There's a ton of shots behind the Chevron station over here. They've been shooting for about 10 minutes and they're not stopping. Can you get somebody over there to tell them to stop shooting? It's too close to neighborhoods here."

So what do you understand her to be communicating in those sentences?

MR. WATKINS: I'm going to object to form. It just calls for speculation.

17 MS. NORINS: I disagree it calls for him 18 to --

> MR. WATKINS: It does, but you can answer as best you can answer.

21 (By Ms. Norins) Based on the words written 22 on the page, what was she communicating?

Α. She's complaining about the noise --

24 Q. And --

> Α. -- from people shooting.

- 1 Q. From the shooting. Right. And when she 2 says it's too close to neighborhoods here, what is 3 she indicating there?
- 4 MR. WATKINS: Same objection.
 - A. And I have no idea what she's trying to communicate there.
- Q. (By Ms. Norins) Is it possible -- is it
 possible -- sorry. I'm getting a block on my sound.
- 9 Is it possible she's communicating a 10 safety concern when she says it's too close to 11 neighborhoods here?
- 12 A. That's not the way I interpret it.
- 13 Q. Is it possible that that was her intent to 14 communicate a safety concern?
- 15 A. I don't know.

6

20

21

1

2

7

10

25

- 16 MR. WATKINS: Object to form.
- 17 Q. (By Ms. Norins) And then the operator, 18 John Archibald, says: "Which Chevron, ma'am?" 19 She says: "Right off Exit 14."
 - So is it fair to say she's provided the general location of where the shots are coming from?
- A. That's a pretty large area, but general, I guess.
- Q. Okay. And would that area that she's
 described, would that allow an officer to know where
 GILBERT & JONES

- MR. WATKINS: Objection to form.
 - A. That's -- that's my interpretation.

85

- Q. (By Ms. Norins) And was that theappropriate thing to do based on the call?
- 6 Q. (By Ms. Norins) Was notifying a deputy of 7 the complaint the appropriate thing to do based on

MR. WATKINS: What specifically, Clare?

the call?

Sure.

1

2

5

8

9

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

3

16

17

18

19

- 10 Q. So based on this call, at this point was 11 there anything harassing about this call?
- 12 A. I don't know. I don't -- I would say no.
- Q. So going to the next call that starts on page 3 at 2:46 p.m. If you could read the transcript of that call, and it goes on to page 4, and let me know when you're finished.
- 17 A. **Okay.**
 - Q. So this is a call that Mr. Prospero placed to the sheriff's office. Again, the Prosperos report they called or Mr. Prospero called the 5100 number and they were transferred again to the dispatch center. Do you have any reason to disbelieve that that's how the call was initiated?

84

83

- to go to see that there's shots and where they're coming from?
- A. Not based off of what I see here, no, ma'am.
- Q. Okay. Do you know where the Chevron is 6 off of Exit 14?
 - A. Yes, ma'am.
- 8 Q. Is that in the general proximity of the
- 9 Runnymeade neighborhood where Mrs. Prospero lives?
 - A. I'd say it's a couple of miles away.
- 11 Q. Okay. Are you sure it's miles?
- 12 A. It might be a mile, mile and a half, two 13 miles. I don't know. I've never measured it.
- Q. Okay. And then a little bit later on at the end of the call, the operator says: "I understand. We will get somebody out there."
- 17 And then Mrs. Prospero says: "Thank you."
- 18 And the operator says: "Bye bye."
- 19 Was that an appropriate response by the
- 20 operator to say we'll get somebody out there?
- A. Meaning that he would advise the patrol division, the deputy assigned of the complaint.
- Q. That's what you think he meant by that?
 THE COURT REPORTER: I'm sorry.
 - Mr. Watkins, I didn't hear you.

GILBERT & JONES

paper here in front of me.

- Q. Okay. You don't know one way or the other?
- 4 A. **No, ma'am.**
- Q. And so Mr. Prospero says -- and I'm at
 line 3 through 5 of page 3 -- "Listen, they have been
 shooting around here now for the last 20 or 25
 minutes."
- 9 So what sort of complaint is he 10 communicating there?
- A. Noise complaint. But there's four minutes
 between the first call and the second call. The
 first one says they've been shooting for 10 minutes.
 The second call 20 to 25 minutes. That's -- that
 doesn't add up.
 - Q. So in your experience when talking with, you know, members in the community who are reporting incidents or concerns, is everybody really accurate in being able to estimate how long things have taken?

20 MR. WATKINS: Object to form.

- A. I would imagine that they would try to be truthful.
- Q. (By Ms. Norins) But in your experience, is it often that people have a different sense of how long something's gone on or how long something's

4

5

10

14

15

16

17

20

22

4

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

- 1 taken than it actually did go on or take?
 - Are you asking me if they blow it out of proportion and misrepresent?
- 4 No. I'm asking you if people, even when 5 they're doing their best to give an accurate account, 6 may not have an exact timer of how long something has 7 taken or how long something has gone on?
 - Α. That's possible, yes, ma'am.
 - Q. And it's not because they're intentionally misrepresenting. It's just because as humans, unless we have a watch and we look at how long something's happened, it's hard to guesstimate; right?
 - Α. Yes, ma'am. Sure.
- 14 0. So then Mr. Prospero, again, identifies 15 where the shooting is coming from. This is at line 7 through 8. He says: "It's right behind the Chevron, 16 Exit 14." 17
- 18 And then the dispatcher says: "Yes, it's 19 a hunting club back there." That's at lines 11 20 through 12. Do you see that?
- 21 Α. Yes, ma'am.
 - Q. Are you familiar with the hunting club in the area of the Chevron off of Exit 14?
- 24 Α. Yes, ma'am. I'm pretty sure that that's a 25 hunting club area.

GILBERT & JONES

Okay. And what's the name of the hunting

club? 2

Q.

2

3

8

9

10

11

12

13

22

23

1

8

9

10

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

- 3 Α. That I don't know.
- 4 And who's the proprietor of the hunting Q. 5 club?
- Well, there are multiple hunting clubs. I 6 Α. 7 don't know which one they're referring to.
 - And when you say you're familiar with the hunting club in that area, do you mean a business or a collection of individuals or something else?
- 11 Α. I don't know. I mean, I'm assuming a collection of individuals. 12
 - Okay. And who are the individuals that you know of who are part of a hunting club in that vicinity of the Chevron off of Exit 14?
 - MR. WATKINS: Clare, are you asking the members of the -- of the people that shoot in
 - MS. NORINS: Can you read back the question, please, Annette.
- 21 (The record was read by the reporter as 22 requested.)
- 23 A. Do you want to know members of the hunting
- 24 club?
- 25 Q. (By Ms. Norins) I want to know the **GILBERT & JONES**

- individuals that you believe constitute a hunting 2 club in that area?
 - Α. I don't know how to answer that. I mean, are you asking if I know who hunts in that area? Or who's a member --
- 6 You said there's a hunting club and that Ο. 7 it consists of individuals as opposed to being a 8 business. And so I'm asking you who are those 9 individuals.

MR. WATKINS: Answer if you can.

- I know that Scott Henning hunts in that 11 12 area. The Paulks, I believe, hunt in that area. I 13 believe that Shane Gentry hunts in that area.
 - (By Ms. Norins) And did those individuals, Scott Henning, the Paulks, Shane Gentry, do they own the property where they hunt?
 - Α. The Paulks do, I believe.
- 18 And what about Mr. Henning and Mr. Gentry? 19 Do they own the area where the hunting club is?
- No, not to the best of my knowledge. 21 Well, I take that back. The Hennings own a portion of property that's in that general area.
- 23 Okay. So then this is the same call that 24 we've been looking at. At the top of page 4, 25 Mr. Prospero says: "It's too close to the neighbor.

GILBERT & JONES

90

- They need to tell them to stop." 1
- 2 What do you understand him to be 3 communicating there?
 - That the sound is too close.
- 5 Ο. Okay. Could Mr. Prospero also be 6 communicating a safety concern about the shots being 7 too close to the neighbor?
- 8 Α. I -- I don't know. I would assume it's 9 sound.
 - Okay. If Mr. Prospero had said the Q. bullets are too close to the neighbor, would that have communicated a safety concern?
 - Possibly the operator would ask further questions, but that's not indicated in here.
 - I'm just trying to figure out if he had said it's the bullets coming too close to the neighbor, would that have communicated a safety concern?

MR. WATKINS: Objection as to form. That's the exact same question you just asked and answered.

- 22 I'm -- it, to me, it indicates sound. If 23 he had said the bullets were too close, then the 24 operator would have gotten further information.
- 25 That's not indicated here.

(By Ms. Norins) But if you just replace it's with the bullets in that sentence, would that communicate a safety concern?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

17

18

19

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- MR. WATKINS: Objection. Asked and answered. You can try again.
- It indicates sound, s-o-u-n-d, sound, not bullets. If he had said bullets, the operator would have questioned him further and gotten more information. That is not indicated here.
- (By Ms. Norins) And why would the operator have questioned him further if he said bullets?
- Because you need more information. Bullets could be a safety issue but this is sound, not bullets.
- Q. Okay. All right. So in terms of the 16 second call that we just looked at between Mr. Prospero and the operator, John Archibald, is there anything harassing about that call in your
- 20 Α. Between the time of the calls, they never 21 had the opportunity to get a deputy there. It says 22 they don't want to speak to a deputy. They don't --23 if it was something dangerous, they would want to see 24 a deputy. They even threatened to call the 25 governor's office. I mean, yes, ma'am, it's becoming **GILBERT & JONES**

transcript, which starts on page 5, and it continues on to page -- bottom of page 7. If you can read that and let me know when you're done.

2:46. Α.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

MR. WATKINS: This is between the officer and dispatch.

THE WITNESS: Oh, okay.

MR. WATKINS: He's going -- he's going to read it now.

(By Ms. Norins) Okay. I want to just go back a minute to Mr. Prospero's call on page 3 of the transcript. At line 19, Mr. Prospero says: "I want the shooting stopped." And in that statement, is he communicating his purpose for calling the sheriff's office?

MR. WATKINS: Where are you pointing to? Line 19 of page 3?

MS. NORINS: Yeah.

MR. WATKINS: Is it only about that statement?

MS. NORINS: Yes. I'm asking does that statement communicate that Mr. Prospero's purpose for calling the sheriff's office was to get the shooting stopped.

No. I don't want contact. I want the **GILBERT & JONES**

91

harassing and disruptive to the service. Absolutely.

- And during this call, was there any appropriate and abusive language used?
- Other than the harassing to call the governor's office, there was no -- no cuss words or anything like that.
- Okay. When you say to call the governor's office, is that something you would consider to be abusive language?
- The way it's used. When Mrs. Prospero said that she was going to call the -- do we need to call the governor's office, that's threats, which is harassing.
- Ο. So is it your position that if Mrs. Prospero has a grievance that's not being addressed by local law enforcement, that she doesn't have a right to contact the governor's office?
- She has a right to -- she has a right to contact the governor's office, of course. But to -they're not even allowing them to address the situation before making the second call.
- Do you agree that she does have the right to contact the governor's office; correct?
 - That's what I just said, yes, ma'am. Α
 - Q. So going on to the next call in the **GILBERT & JONES**

shooting stopped.

(By Ms. Norins) Is that -- is that communicating his purpose for calling?

MR. WATKINS: Object to form. It calls for speculation. You can answer as best you can.

- Α. I have no idea.
- 8 (By Ms. Norins) Reading those words 9 doesn't tell you anything about why he called?
 - He's calling to complain about the noise from the shooters.
 - And is his purpose as expressed that statement that he wants the shooting stopped?
 - Well, he's attempting to annoy and bully the operators to basically get -- get -- get their way would be my interpretation of it.
- 17 But in terms of his purpose for calling, is it to get the shooting stopped? 18
- 19 I'd say it's to harass the operators and 20 basically try to get -- if they bully enough, they'll 21 get what they want.
- 22 Is that how you interpret his statement, I 23 want the shooting stopped, that he's trying to 24 harass?
 - Α. That's how I interpret the phone call, the **GILBERT & JONES**

- contact with the 911 center. I can't pick apart 1 2 line-by-line what he's saying. It's the -- it's the 3 call itself.
 - So your -- your impression of the call is Ο. that it's bullying or harassing; is that correct?
- 6 Δ Yes.

5

10

11

13

16

17

1

2

3

4

5

6 7

- 7 Q. And I'm asking as far as what Mr. Prospero 8 is stating is his intent for calling, if he's stating 9 that he's calling to get the shooting stopped?
 - MR. WATKINS: You are referring to lines 18 and 19?
- 12 MS. NORINS: Well, specifically 19.
 - MR. WATKINS: Just that one sentence.
- 14 And you want to know the intent behind 15 that sentence?
 - Q. (By Ms. Norins) I want to know is that communicating his reason for calling.
- 18 Α. That one sentence does not. Not in my 19 opinion.
- 20 Okay. So going on to the next call Q. 21 between Officer Sullivan and Ms. Nikki Flowers. Do you know who Officer Sullivan is? Ryan Sullivan? 22
- 23 Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 24 Ο. And do you know who Sergeant Susan Nikki 25 Flowers is?

GILBERT & JONES

- Α. Yes, ma'am.
- Q. And here on page 5 at line 15 through 17, Officer Sullivan said: "Yes, the Paulks back there shooting on their private property." And based on his statement there, would he have had to go to the location to know that it was the Paulks shooting?
 - Α. I have no idea, ma'am.
- 8 Ο. You mentioned that there's also a 9 Scott Henning who owns some of the property in that 10 area?
- 11 MR. WATKINS: Object to form. You can 12 answer as best you can.
- 13 Mr. Henning owns property in the area.
- 14 (By Ms. Norins) And so just based on the description of where the shooting was coming from, 15 that the Prosperos provided, could it have been 16 17 Mr. Henning was shooting as opposed to the Paulks?
- I guess it could have been anybody. I 18 don't know. 19
- 20 And how would the officer assigned in this 21 case, Ryan Sullivan, have determined who was 22 shooting?
- 23 I have no idea. You'd have to ask 24 Deputy Sullivan that question.
 - Would he have needed to go to the area to **GILBERT & JONES**

see who was shooting?

2

9

10

16

17

23

25

11

13

15

16

22

25

96

- You'd have to ask Deputy Sullivan that Α. 3 question.
- 4 Q. Is there any way he could have determined 5 who was shooting other than going to the area?
- 6 Α. You'll have to ask Deputy Sullivan that 7 question.
- 8 I'm asking you based on your many years of Q. experience as sheriff and as a deputy before that, how you would determine who was shooting?
- 11 How would I determine? I wasn't assigned to this call. Deputy Sullivan was. I don't know how 12 13 he did it.
- 14 Q. But how would you go about determining it 15 if this was your assigned call?
 - Α. It depends.
 - Tell me what does it depend on. Q.
- 18 I could pick up the phone and call someone 19 and ask them, hey, are you out there shooting.
- 20 Q. Okay.
- 21 Α. Or -- or I could go out there or I could 22 call a name.
- Q. Okay. So you've identified you could call 24 to ask them if they're shooting. You could go to the area to see who was shooting. Are there any other

GILBERT & JONES

- ways you can think of that you could identify who was 2 doing the shooting?
- 3 Well, prior knowledge of what's going on. They -- hell, we've got a drone. I could fly a drone 4 5 over it. I mean, the question you're asking I don't
- know the answer to what -- you'd have to ask
- 7 Deputy Sullivan how he knew.
- 8 But I'm just asking you what were the different ways to go about finding out who was 10 shooting. So you --
 - Α. And I've given you a number of ways.
- 12 Calling. Go to visit. Q.
 - Flying a drone over it. Α.
- 14 Ο. Flying a drone.
 - Α. Prior knowledge.
 - Well, what does prior knowledge refer to? Q.
- 17 Α. Incidents that have occurred prior that
- you had knowledge of. 18
- 19 But that would be speculation of who was Q. 20 shooting based on prior incidents?
- 21 Α. Possibly.
 - Q. Do officers have drones that they can just
- 23 deploy at will?
- 24 No. Not each officer has a drone. Α.
 - Q. Okay. Would a deputy such as

5

6

7

8

10

11

14

15

16

17

18

19

4

5

6

7

14

15

16

17

25

- Ryan Sullivan have a drone with him that he could 1 2 deploy?
- 3 Α. I don't believe that Deputy Sullivan is 4 assigned a drone.
- 5 Okay. So not all officers have access to 6 drones?
 - Α. I think they can certainly call someone that has one and that's access.
- 9 Okay. But as far as you know, Deputy Sullivan does not have a drone of his own to 10 use? 11
- 12 Α. As far as I know, he does not.
- Q. 13 And was that true in 2018 as well?
 - Α. That's true with what?
- 15 Q. Was that true in 2018 as well, which was the time of these events? 16
- Α. That would be true. 17

7

8

14

23

1

2

3

4

5

7

8

9

13

14

15

16

25

- 18 Okay. And then do you see on page 5 at 19 line 21 through 22, Officer Sullivan says: "Yeah, those mother fuckers. I ain't going to -- I ain't 20 going out there talk to Robert about, hey, man, you 21 22 can't shoot on your private property because you're
- 24 Do you see that?
- 25 Α. Yes, ma'am.

disturbing people."

- Of the conversation. And then later on, on page 6 at line 5 through 6, Officer Sullivan, again, uses the term "stupid mother fuckers" in reference to the complaints about the gunshots; correct?
- Α. 6 Yes, ma'am.
 - Q. And are officers in your department trained to speak in that manner about members of the community that they serve?
- 10 First, it's an office, not a department. Α. 11 And, no, they're not trained to speak like that to 12 people.
 - Q. Okay. How would you like your officers to talk about members of the community when they're discussing with their coworkers calls for service? MR. WATKINS: Object to form.
- 17 I would hope they wouldn't use that type of language. I don't. 18
- 19 (By Ms. Norins) So then on page 6, lines 20 11 through 13, Officer Sullivan says: "Let them leave their fucking address or something or request 21 22 contact. I'll let them know how stupid they are."
- 23 Do you see that part of the conversation?
- 24 Α. Yes, ma'am.
 - Q. And so is Officer Sullivan saying that he **GILBERT & JONES**

- would need them to request contact before he could 2 contact them himself?
- 3 MR. WATKINS: Object to form. You can 4 answer it as best you can.
 - You'd have to ask Deputy Sullivan that.
 - Ο. (By Ms. Norins) Do -- if a caller calls in and reports something and says they don't want to be contacted, they just want to make a report about what's going on, is the assigned officer required to contact the caller?
 - Α. Not always.
- 12 Is that up to the officer's discretion 13 whether they contact the caller?
 - Α. Yes, ma'am.
 - Is that true as well as the caller Ο. contacts 911 and says I don't want contact. I just want to report this. Then it's up to the assigned officer to decide whether to contact them?
 - Yes, ma'am.
- 20 And the officer's not required to contact Q. them? It's just a judgment call on the officer's 21 22 part?
- 23 Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 24 Okay. So go to page 8. This is the call Q. 25 that starts at 2:58 p.m. This is Mrs. Prospero's **GILBERT & JONES**

- call to 911. If you can read over this conversation. 1 It goes on to the bottom of page 11. And let me know 3 when you're done.
 - Have you had a chance to read that transcript?
 - Α. Yes, ma'am.
- Ms. Prospero starts out talking with the operator, John Archibald, and she says at lines 4 through 6: "There's tons of shots and they keep 10 going and going around the Chevron 11 station."
- 12 Is she -- is she communicating a noise 13 complaint there?
 - Α. Yes, ma'am.
 - And then at line 10 through 12, she says: "It's too close to the neighborhood. The shots are coming too close."
- And there is she communicating a safety 18 19 concern?
- 20 Α. No, ma'am. I believe it's continuation of 21 the noise complaint.
- 22 The fact that when she says, "it's too Q. 23 close to the neighborhood," that has no safety 24 implications in your view?
 - In the context of the call, no, ma'am. **GILBERT & JONES**

And a little bit further down, she says: "But they're not, because of the noise ordinances, they're not supposed to have that," referring to the hunting club.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

24

25

Α.

- When she says "noise ordinances," would she be referring to the Camden County nuisance ordinance that we talked about before?
- Α. No, ma'am. I have no idea she's -- she's talking about noise ordinance and the city has a noise ordinance, but not the county.
- But the county has a nuisance ordinance that covers noise that we talked about earlier; right?
 - MR. WATKINS: We'll stipulate that the county has the nuisance ordinance we talked about earlier.

MS. NORINS: Okay.

- (By Ms. Norins) So isn't that what she would be referring to there in that statement about noise ordinances?
 - MR. WATKINS: Object to form. He's already answered he thinks. If you ask him to speculate, which is what that question is asking him to do, as to what your client is referring to in a call, he gave his opinion that he **GILBERT & JONES**

104

103

thought it was the city ordinance. You didn't like that answer. So you've asked him now the exact same question again.

The question's objectionable, Clare, because it calls for sheer speculation on his part as to what your client was referring to. And beyond that, he's asked and answered it to the best of his ability three hours into this deposition. But . . .

- (By Ms. Norins) So when she says noise ordinance, do you know what she means by that?
- It means a noise ordinance. The county does not have a noise ordinance. The city does. I would assume she's referring to the city noise ordinance.
- Q. Okay. All right. I think you had testified earlier that the Chevron off of Exit 14 was maybe a mile, mile and a half from Mrs. Prospero's neighborhood; is that correct?

MR. WATKINS: Object to form.

- 21 I believe I testified that I wasn't sure. 22 I was guessing about a mile to a mile and a half. I 23 didn't testify that that's how far it was.
 - (By Ms. Norins) Okay. But that's your estimate. And from what we saw on the transcript **GILBERT & JONES**

- with Sullivan speaking to Nikki Flowers, he believes
- 2 the shots are coming from the Paulk's property; is
- 3 that correct?
- 4 Yes, ma'am. That's what the transcript Α. 5 says.
- 6 Ο. Okay. And in Officer Sullivan's
- 7 interrogatory responses in this case, he identified
- the Paulk's property as consisting of parcel No.
- 077021, parcel No. 077021A and parcel No. 077021B.
- Do you have any reason to dispute that those are the 10
- 11 parcel numbers that the Paulks own?
- 12 Α. No, ma'am.
- 13 Q. And so I'm going to share with you an 14 aerial photo from the county tax assessors' office in
- 15 Camden County. Do you see that? And I can make it
- 16 larger, I think. Hold on. Sorry. I'm trying to get
- it to go into full screen here. 17
 - Okay. Can you see that?
- 19 Α.

18

25

2

7

10

19

- 20 Q. Okay. So here we have in the aqua
- 21 highlighted rectangle, that's 84 Magna Carta Drive,
- 22 the Prospero's address. Do you see it down here
- 23 where my cursor is?
- 24 Α. Yes, ma'am.
 - Okay. And you've been to their house Q. **GILBERT & JONES**

before; correct? 1

- Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 3 And so does this rectangle that shows 84

106

- 4 Magna Carta Drive, does that comport with your
- 5 recollection of where the house is located?
- 6 Α. Yes, ma'am.
 - And then we have the Paulk's property Q.
- 8 parcels. We have 077021. Do you see where my cursor
- 9 is?
 - Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 11 Q. And 077021A is another one that they own?
- 12 Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 13 And then 077021B is another piece of their Q.
- 14 property.
- 15 Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 16 Q. And so is it fair to say that these
- 17 properties that the Paulks own all border the lake
- that's behind the Prospero's house? 18
 - Α. Parts of them, yes, ma'am.
- 20 Okay. And so someone shooting on the
- 21 Paulk's property, could -- could they be shooting in
- 22 very close proximity to this lake behind the
- 23 Prospero's home?
- 24 Α. I don't know how to answer that. They
- 25 could.

- 1 And because this is such a large area, 2 those three parcels that the Paulks own, would you 3 need to go -- would you need to go and actually see 4 where the shots were coming from to know if they were 5 close to the Prosperos or not?
 - Δ I don't know.

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

1

2

3

4

5

6

11

12

13

14

15

- Well, would you be able to tell where on these three parcels of property the shots were coming from without going to see?
 - I would want to go see.
- Ο. All right. Let's stop sharing. Okay. So turning back to this 911 call, the transcript, on pages 8 through 11, referring you to page 9 at line 7 through 8, Mrs. Prospero says -- she's been asked: "Do you want to see a deputy?"
- She says: "No, I don't. I just want it 16 stopped." 17
- 18 And what is she communicating there, to 19 vour understanding?
- 20 MR. WATKINS: Object to form.
- 21 Α. She's -- she's complaining about the 22 noise.
- 23 Q. (By Ms. Norins) She's saying she wants it 24 stopped; correct?
- 25 MR. WATKINS: Object to form. **GILBERT & JONES**

108

107

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

24

25

- Yes. She wants the -- she wants the noise Α. to stop.
- (By Ms. Norins) And then also on this same page up at the very top in lines 1 through 2, she says there: "We just want it stopped." Is that what the transcript says?
- 7 Α. Yes, ma'am. That's what the transcript 8 says.
- 9 And so is she stating there that that's 10 what she's hoping to achieve with her call?
 - The deputy and the judge determined that the purpose was to disrupt the 911 center and her SM.
 - But Mrs. Prospero's own words, is she stating her purpose for calling is that she just wants it stopped, referring to the gunshots?
- I don't see the word "purpose" anywhere in 16 Α. 17 there.
- 18 Q. Is that statement communicating her 19 purpose for calling?
- 20 MR. WATKINS: Object to form.
- 21 I think that statement's a continuation of Α. the harassment. 22
- 23 (By Ms. Norins) So asking to have the 24 gunshots stopped, you're stating constitutes 25 harassment?

GILBERT & JONES

- It's the contact -- it's the call. You 2 can't nitpick the sentence in its entirety. The call 3 in its entirety is -- it's the third call. She's trying to harass and disrupt the 911 center. She's threatened to call the governor. She's threatened to 6 call TV stations. It's harassment.
- So when she says that she is going to call the TV station, that was in response to 8 Sergeant Flowers saying, "We've dispatched the deputy to come to your residence"?

Do you see that on page 10? Page 10 at line 23, Mrs. Prospero says: "Well, I don't want anybody at our house here. It's Thanksgiving and we don't -- we have -- we don't want anybody at our house. We're not the ones doing anything wrong."

Do you see that? Sorry. I need you to confirm that you saw that on the transcript.

- 18 I see it, yes, ma'am.
- 19 Ο. And then she says: "But I can go to the 20 TV station." Is that what you're referring to when 21 you say she said she was going to call the TV 22 station?
- 23 Α. Well, it says it there, but it also says 24 it down at the bottom where she says: "Well, we'll 25 call the TV station."

GILBERT & JONES

110

Right. And that's also in response to Q. Sergeant Flowers saying he --

THE COURT REPORTER: I'm sorry, Ms. Norins. Could you repeat that. You went in and out.

MS. NORINS: So my question? THE COURT REPORTER: Yes, ma'am.

MS. NORINS: What's the last thing that you have, Annette?

THE COURT REPORTER: And that's also in response to Sergeant Flowers saying.

MS. NORINS: That the deputy is on his way to come and explain to you in person.

MR. WATKINS: So you want to skip from there down to -- you want to skip those next two -- you're skipping these next two communications and then going to the TV and asking if it's in response to something up above?

MS. NORINS: Yes.

21 (By Ms. Norins) I mean, those next two 22 communications: "Well, I am not answering the door. 23

We're leaving. Good-bye." That's Mrs. Prospero.

And then Sergeant Flowers says: "Okay." And Mrs. Prospero says: "We will call the

1 TV station"?

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

20

1

2

3

4 5

6 7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- MR. WATKINS: Your question, for the witness, your question is whether the last Prospero comment is in response to the one up above that starts okay.
- Q. (By Ms. Norins) So my question is: For both of these references that Mrs. Prospero made to calling the TV station, were those in response to Sergeant Flowers saying a deputy was coming to their house?
- 11 A. I'm sorry. I don't believe so.
- Q. Okay. Okay. So going ahead a couple of pages in the transcript to page 16. This is a conversation between Officer Sullivan and the part I'm going to ask you about Mary Hess, who is a dispatch operator. And if you could just read that and let me know when you're finished.

18 MR. WATKINS: Pain 16, Clare?
 19 MS. NORINS: Yes. 16.

MR. WATKINS: Okay. Okay.

Q. (By Ms. Norins) Okay. So on page 16, lines 6 through 7, Officer Sullivan asks: "Did Ms. Prospero curse at anybody or use offensive or obscene language?"

25 And Mary Hess answers: "She didn't use GILBERT & JONES

A. I would assume that to be correct.

Q. Okay. And so he's talking to the dispatch operators to find out what was said on the calls; is that fair to say?

A. Yes, ma'am.

5

10

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

25

1

2

3

5

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

Q. And so here Mary Hess, one of the
 operators, is stating she, referring to Ms. Prospero,
 just was not a happy camper and she wanted y'all to
 get it taken care of.

And so my question is: Is Mary Hess communicating what the dispatch officers understood Mrs. Prospero's purpose to be in calling?

A. It doesn't say the word "purpose" in there.

Q. You can use the word "purpose," "reason."

Are they communicating -- is Mary Hess communicating to Officer Sullivan the reason that Mrs. Prospero was calling as far as the dispatch operators can tell?

A. No. No, ma'am.

20 Q. I'm sorry. I didn't hear your answer.

21 A. **No, ma'am.**

Q. So what do you think Mary Hess iscommunicating there to Officer Sullivan?

24 A. The complaint.

Q. That she wanted to get it taken care of; GILBERT & JONES

114

offensive language or curse." Do you see that?

- A. Yes, ma'am.
- Q. Okay. And then a little bit further down,
 Mary Hess says: "She just was not a happy camper and
 she wanted y'all to get it taken care of." Do you
 see that?
 - A. Yes, ma'am.
- Q. And in this statement, is Mary Hess reporting to Officer Sullivan Mrs. Prospero's purpose in calling?

MR. WATKINS: Object to form.

- A. It appears to me that the deputy's trying to get information from dispatch. He's in the process of looking up a code section, I would assume, and he's reading the code section. That's why he's asking about the offensive or obscene language.
 - Q. Right.
- A. But the deputy and the judge determined the purpose of the call to be disruptive to the 911 center and harassment that violated -- it's a misdemeanor violation of Georgia law.
- Q. So, from looking at the transcript, is it fair to say that Officer Sullivan was not a party to any of the Prosperos' calls? He wasn't on the line during the calls?

GILBERT & JONES

correct?

- A. She wanted the noise to stop.
- Q. So, again, based on your years of experience as sheriff and before that as deputy in other positions in the sheriff's office, if you were going to charge someone with unlawful conduct during a 911 call, would you want to listen to the call before you made the charge?
 - A. **Not necessarily.**
- Q. You don't think it would be important to hear what was actually said during the call before you decided to charge?
- A. He was talking to the 911 center. The deputy was talking to the 911 center.
- Q. Right. But he had the option to listen to the recording of the call as well. That's been established by prior testimony.

So if he has the option to listen, would that not be preferable to actually hear the call as opposed to relying on what the operator tells him about the call?

- A. I would imagine that Deputy Sullivan trusted the operators telling him what would . . .
- Q. And I'm just asking would it not be a more direct source of information to just listen to the

8

16

17

18 19

20

23

24

25

3

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17 18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

4

5

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

21

22

After the fact. Α

Ο. While she was still in custody, were you

aware that she was there? 6

> Α. No, ma'am.

With respect to her bond appearance, I'm going to ask you to look at a document that we previously marked. Let me find that.

MR. WATKINS: Can you give me one minute.

I need to step out for just one second.

MS. NORINS: Yeah. Sure. That's fine.

(Recess from 1:18 p.m. to 1:26 p.m.)

15 (By Ms. Norins) Okay. So earlier I had you, sir, look at a aerial view photograph/map that 16 17 showed the 84 Magna Carta Drive property parcel and then also the property parcels identified as 18

19 belonging to the Paulks. Do you recall looking at

20 that map?

> Α. Yes, ma'am.

Okay. And so we're going to mark that map as Plaintiff's Exhibit 37? Is that what we're up to?

23 THE COURT REPORTER: Yes, ma'am.

24 25 MS. NORINS: 37. And Brad, can we

GILBERT & JONES

And do you see where it says "Attested and 4 approved by" and then it has your signature and name?

> Α. Yes, ma'am. I see that.

Okay. And was that a stamp that was used 6 7 to put your signature and name?

Α. Yes, ma'am.

9 Okay. And did you personally stamp the 10 document or did someone do that for you?

11 Α. Someone else would have done that.

12 Okay. Who would that have been? Q.

> It could have been a number of people. Α.

13 14 Okay. What are the possibilities? Not

15 their names but their positions. Who would do that?

My records clerk, my jail administrator, my chief deputy, my executive assistant. Those would be the primary ones who would come to my mind.

Okay. And they all have a stamp with your signature and name?

21 There's one stamp. Actually, there's two. Α. 22 My finance director has one also.

Okay. And what does this mean where it says attested and approved by, and then it has their signature and name?

- If I approved the form of the bond. 1 Α.
 - Q. By "form," what do you mean?
- 3 Α. Whether it's cash, property, bonding 4 agency.
 - Okay. So are you attesting and approving the amount of the bond or just the --
 - Not the amount, but that whoever signed it over here, which is Okey Armitrout, that he has the authority to bond this person out.
 - Okay. So you're attesting and approving that it's okay for him to put up the bond for Mrs. Prospero?
 - Α. Yes, ma'am.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

22

And looking at this document, it has some language about -- I'm looking kind of in the middle of the document. It says: "Shall not depart thence without leave of said court, then the above obligation to be null and void." Do you see that part of the sentence there?

MR. WATKINS: No, we have not found that.

- (By Ms. Norins) Okay. It's right under "to wit: Prospero Emma Jane. And then the next line says: "And shall not depart thence without leave of said court."
 - MR. WATKINS: It looks like it's a **GILBERT & JONES**

120

- continuation of a sentence. Would you like the witness to read --
- (By Ms. Norins) Yeah, read the whole sentence, if you don't mind, and then I have a question.
 - MR. WATKINS: Why don't we read it into the record, if we could.

MS. NORINS: Okay. Here we go, Annette.

- (By ms. Norins) "The condition of the above obligation is such that the above bound principle shall be and appear at the Superior Court of said county at the time fixed by said court for his or her arraignments. Notice of which said date will be late furnished him or her by the clerk of court and from day-to-day and term-to-term, then and there to answer for the offenses of unlawful conduct during 911 call, to wit: Prospero, Emma Jane, and shall not depart thence without leave of said court, then the above obligation to be null and void else to
- remain in full force and in effect." 21 Did I read that correctly?
 - Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 23 Okay. And where it says, "shall not 24 depart thence," do you have an understanding of what 25 that means?
 - **GILBERT & JONES**

- That she's got to be present for her 2 arraignment.
 - Q. Okay. So is this bond appearance requiring Mrs. Prospero to appear at whatever time the court gives her for her arraignment?
 - Α. Yes, ma'am.

3

4

5

6

8 9

12

13

14

15

17

20

22

23

24

1

4

5

10

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

21

22

23

24

- 7 Q. And how -- how much advance notice does the court typically give of arraignment dates?
 - Α. I have no idea.
- 10 Is it possible that the arraignment date Q. could be set just the day before it's happening? 11
 - I guess anything's possible, but I wouldn't believe that the court would typically act that way.
- Q. Okay. In your experience, how much 16 advanced notice is given to defendants of their arraignment date?
- I've seen it as far back as a month or 18 Α. 19 two.
- And what's the shortest advanced notice Q. 21 that you recall seeing?

MR. WATKINS: Are you talking about for somebody that's been released on bond? MS. NORINS: Yes.

MR. WATKINS: That's not in custody? 25

GILBERT & JONES

122

MS. NORINS: Right.

- 2 Α. I don't know of anything less than a 3 month.
 - (By Ms. Norins) Okay. And what happens if Q. you don't show up for your arraignment date?
- 6 Normally you would be -- a bench warrant 7 would be issued for failure to appear.
- 8 Ο. And that would be a separate charge 9 against you?
 - Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 11 So it's pretty important to show up for 12 your arraignment?
 - Absolutely.
 - So Mrs. Prospero was arrested on a Monday night in January. And would a bond hearing normally have been held on a Tuesday? Like are bond hearings normally going on on Tuesdays?
 - It depends on the magistrate. Judge Lewis, I believe, set the bond on this?
- 20 Q. Yes.
 - Α. It varies. Sometimes she'll do them in the morning. Sometimes she'll do them in the afternoon. Sometimes she'll do a Monday and then Wednesday and Friday. It varies. There's no way to predict how Judge Lewis is going to conduct her --

- that's something you'd have to ask her. 1
- Okay. And is Judge Lewis the only 2 3 magistrate judge that conducts bond hearings for
- 4 **Camden County Jail arrestees?**
 - She's the chief magistrate, and then I don't know how many deputy magistrates she has.
- 7 And do the deputy magistrates conduct bond 8 hearings as well?
- 9 Α. Yes, ma'am.

6

17

1

2

3

4

5

6

- Well, if it's a day that she's --10
- Magistrate Lewis is not hearing bonds, would one of 11
- 12 the other judges typically be doing it?

I don't know.

- If she asked them to, yes, ma'am. 13 A.
- 14 0. As far as you know, has Mrs. Prospero 15 contacted the sheriff's office since her arrest in
- January of 2019? 16 A.
- 18 You're not aware of any contacts that
- 19 she's made?
- 20 Α. No, ma'am.
- 21 So at any time either before or after
- 22 Mrs. Prospero's arrest, did you have any
- 23 conversations with her or -- sorry. Did you have any
- 24 conversations about her with Ryan Sullivan?
- 25 Α. Since her arrest?

GILBERT & JONES

- At any time either before or after her arrest, did you have any conversations about Mrs. Prospero with Ryan Sullivan?
- Yesterday we passed in the front office and I told him I had a deposition today.
 - Ο. And did you mention Mrs. Prospero?
- 7 Yes, ma'am. Α.
- 8 THE COURT REPORTER: I'm sorry. What was
- 9 the answer?
- 10 Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 11 (By Ms. Norins) And was anything else said during that conversation with Ryan Sullivan?
- 12
- 13 Not that I recollect. I was passing -- we 14 were just literally passed in the office.
- 15 Okay. And is that the only conversation you have ever had with Ryan Sullivan about 16
- 17 Mrs. Prospero?
- The best of my recollection. 18 Α
- 19 Okay. Have you had any conversations with
- **Russell Prescott about Mrs. Prospero?** 20
- 21 Α. Not that I can recall.
 - Have you had any conversations with
- 23 John Archibald, who's a dispatch operator, about
- 24 Mrs. Prospero?

22

25 Α. Not that I can recall.

GILBERT & JONES

- Have you had any conversations with 2 Susan Nikki Flowers about Mrs. Prospero?
- 3 Α. Not that can I recall.
- 4 Have you had any conversations with
- 5 Mary Hess, who's also a dispatch operator, about 6 Mrs. Prospero?
- 7 Α. Not that I can recall.
- 8 Do you know who Samantha Eason is? She 9 used to work in the Camden County Jail.
 - Α. No, ma'am. I'm sorry.
 - You don't know who that is? Q.
- 12 Α. No, ma'am.

10

11

17

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

16

17

18

23

25

- 13 Q. Have you had any conversations about
- 14 Mrs. Prospero with Rob Mastroianni?
- 15 Α. Yes, ma'am. I told you about that earlier. 16
 - Q. Right. About the depositions?
- 18 Α. Yes, ma'am.
- 19 Ο. Okay. Other than those conversations, 20 have you had any conversations with -- he's a
- 21 major -- Major Mastroianni about Mrs. Prospero?
- 22 None that I can recall.
- 23 And have you had any conversations with 24 Chuck Byerly about Mrs. Prospero other than talking 25
 - about the depositions?

GILBERT & JONES

126

- Yes, ma'am. Remember, I assigned him to 1 2 that case. We had discussed it and he had -- he already knew who the Prosperos were. I believe that 3 they had, before I took office as sheriff, that they 4 5 had been making calls to the office.
 - Okay. And other than that conversation where you assigned Byerly to the Prospero's case, as you referred to it, have you had any other conversations with him about Mrs. Prospero?
 - I'm sure that she's come up in passing, but I -- I can't recall the content of conversations with him.
 - Q. How many conversations in total do you think you've had with Byerly about Mrs. Prospero?
- 15 Α. I have no earthly idea.
 - Did you speak to anyone from the district Q. attorney's office about Mrs. Prospero at any time?
 - No. No, ma'am. Not that I can recall.
- 19 Q. Okay. Sorry. There's one thing I -- just 20 give me a minute. There's a document that I wanted 21 to ask you about I need to locate. If you need to 22 take a break, you can. I'll be right back.

(Recess from 1:41 p.m. to 1:45 p.m.)

24 MS. NORINS: Brad, the document is

defendant's production at page 45. It's part of

- $1\quad \ \ \, \text{recollection of being contacted by the deputies on}$
- $2\quad \mbox{this date.} \ \mbox{The complaint or the report refers to}$
- 3 unable to get into the gates. They are locked.
 - Do you know what gates that would be referring to?
 - A. I'm assuming that since it has my name adjoining to it, it would be one of three gates along that dirt road, which would be Satilla Bluff Road West.
- 10 Q. Okay. And of those three gates, are you 11 the property owner of one set or all three sets of 12 gates?
- A. Well, it would be the three referred to,
 where it says "made contact with property owner," and
 has my name, there are three gates on that piece of
 property.
- 17 Q. **Okay.**

5

6

7

8

9

1

8

9

10

11

13

- 18 A. In that area.
- Q. Okay. And do you allow people to come
 onto your property for purposes of shooting or
 hunting?
- A. Hunting club has access to it and they use it.
- Q. Okay. And that's the hunting club that involves Mr. Henning and, I'm sorry, Mr. Gentry, I GILBERT & JONES

- Q. And do you have an agreement now?
 - A. Yes, ma'am.
- Q. Okay. So I know you said you don't have a recollection of being contacted on this date, which was looks like April 1st of 2011. Do you recall any other times that you were contacted in your capacity as a property owner about the Prospero's complaints of shooting?
 - A. **No.**

1

2

9

10

11

12

13

18

19

20

21

22

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

20

21

22

25

- Q. Okay. And just so I understand, and sorry if I'm repeating myself, but you are the owner of the entire property parcel that's numbered 090003?
 - A. Myself and my siblings.
- Q. Okay. Okay. Let's just take a
 five-minute break and then I think we're done. I
 just want to look over everything one last time.
 Thank you for your patience.

(Recess from 1:57 p.m. to 2:04 p.m.)

- Q. (By Ms. Norins) Okay. Sheriff, just a few more questions. You said you were not personally shooting guns on your property on Thanksgiving Day 2018; is that correct?
- 23 A. That's correct.
- Q. And was the informal hunting club that you
 have a written agreement with to use your property,
 GILBERT & JONES

132

131

- think you told me?
- 2 A. Yes, ma'am.
- THE COURT REPORTER: I'm sorry. Could you repeat that. Involves Mr. Henning and?
- 5 MS. NORINS: Mr. Gentry and the Paulks.
- 6 THE COURT REPORTER: And your answer, sir?
 7 A. Henning and Gentry, but the Paulks aren't
 - A. Henning and Gentry, but the Paulks aren't part of that hunting club, I don't believe.
 - Q. (By Ms. Norins) Okay. So the property that you own that we saw in the map as part of parcel 090003 is used as a hunting club by at least
- 12 Mr. Henning and Mr. Gentry; is that fair to say?
 - A. And others, yes, ma'am.
- 14 Q. And others. Okay. And do they --
- 15 A. I'm sorry. I was just going to say I 16 don't know who the members of the club are.
- 17 Q. Do they have to get your permission to use 18 your land as a informal hunting club?
- A. Yes, ma'am. They -- they -- we have an
 agreement with them that it is an annual agreement.
- 21 Q. Is that a written agreement?
- 22 A. **Yes, ma'am.**
- Q. And did you have such an agreement in
- 24 **2018?**
- 25 A. Yes, ma'am.

- were any of those folks shooting their guns onThanksgiving Day 2018 on your property?
- 3 A. I have no idea.
 - O. Where were you on that day?
- 5 A. I would have either been at my mother's 6 house or at my in-laws' house, one of the two.
 - Q. And where's your mother's house, just generally speaking?
 - A. In Woodbine.
 - Q. Okay. And where are your in-laws' house or is your in-laws' house?
 - A. I'm sorry. Deland, Florida.
 - Q. Okay. So you would have either been in Woodbine or Florida?
- 15 A. Yes, ma'am.
- Q. The informal hunting club, do they have permission to just come and go on your property as they wish to? They don't have to notify you like, hey, you're coming today?
 - A. That would be correct.
 - Q. So they just come and go at will?
 - A. Yes, ma'am. There're two lots. A lot
- that belongs to the family and then they have a lotfor their hunting club.
 - Q. Okay. So is it possible that the informal GILBERT & JONES

25

Annette Pacheco, CCR-B-2153

GILBERT & JONES

Let me ask you, Sheriff: You were asked

whether you would have gone out to investigate a

GILBERT & JONES

24

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 9 10 Page No. ___ Line No. ___ should read:_ 11 12 Page No. ___ Line No. ___ should read: __ 13 14 Page No. ___ Line No. ___ should read: __ 15 Page No. ___ Line No. ___ should read: _ 16 Page No. ___ Line No. ___ should read: __ 17 18 Page No. ___ Line No. ___ should read: __ 19 20 Page No. ___ Line No. ___ should read: __ 21 __ Line No. ___ should read:_ Page No. 22 23 Page No. ___ Line No. ___ should read:__ 24 Page No. ___ Line No. ___ should read:___ 25 **GILBERT & JONES**